THE DESIGN OF RURAL DEVELOPMENT:
PROPOSALS FOR THE EVOLUTION OF A
SOCIAL CONTRACT SUITED TO
CONDITIONS IN SOUTHERN AFRICA
PART II
Norman Reynolds
Saldru Working Paper No. 41

Cape Town August 1981
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE OF CONTENTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PART I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTER 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents continued

CHAPTER 7 AGRICULTURAL CREDIT : THE ROLE OF THE CREDIT UNION 57

Introduction 57
The Proposal: a national banking system built upon the Credit Union 60
The Credit Union League 69
Conclusion 70
Footnotes to Chapter 7 71

CHAPTER 8 AGRICULTURAL RESEARCH AND EXTENSION 72

The Organisation of Agricultural Research and Extension 82
The Organisation of the Extension System 84
What is an Optimum Level of Investment in Agricultural Research and Extension? 92
Footnotes to Chapter 8 96

TABLES

CHAPTER 1 I Black Poverty in South Africa: 1980 7
II Growth of Urban Population 7

CHAPTER 2 I Additional Expenditure from Wage Income of Public Works 24

FIGURES

CHAPTER 4 1 Marginal Cost and Marginal Revenue 31
2 Marginal Cost and Marginal Revenue 31

CHAPTER 5 1 Initial Rural Organisation 46
2 Rural Organisation after Community Development 46
3 Rural Organisation Proposed: Autonomous Communities 47

CHAPTER 8 1 The Classic Extension Model 77
2 With Attempts to Improve Communication 77
3 With Multi-disciplinary Research into Farmer Systems 77
4 Organisation Chart: Agricultural Research and Extension 85
5 The Proposed Agricultural Extension Model 94

PART II/
### Table of Contents continued

#### PART II

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 9</th>
<th>THE UTILITY OF A COMBINED PERIODIC SERVICE AND REGULATED MARKET SYSTEM IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF ECONOMIC HINTERLANDS: THE CASE OF ZIMBABWE'S TRIBAL TRUST LANDS</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Proposal</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Regulated Market Society</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Footnotes to Chapter 9</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 10</th>
<th>CO-OPERATIVE DAIRYING AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE SMALL MIXED FARM SECTOR</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Footnotes to Chapter 10</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 11</th>
<th>AN APPROACH TO A COMMUNITY LED, STATE SUPPORTED SCHOOL SYSTEM</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Voucher System</td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Objections to the Voucher System</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Cross-Over Tax</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Financial Benefits of a Voucher Plus Tax System</td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Brief Notes on the System</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Education and Rural Development</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 12</th>
<th>HEALTH: PREVENTION IS STILL REVOLUTIONARY</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Footnotes to Chapter 12</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 13</th>
<th>RURAL ELECTRIFICATION</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Footnotes to Chapter 13</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 14</th>
<th>RIGHTS, PUBLIC INTEREST LAW AND THE FURTHERANCE OF DEMOCRATIC INSTITUTIONS</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Footnotes to Chapter 14</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 15</th>
<th>MANPOWER AND THE USE OF SOCIETY'S RESOURCES</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Staffing Rural Institutions</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Short-term Consultancy</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Opening the way to public and private sector financial, technical and managerial support for development programmes</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER 16</th>
<th>IMPLEMENTATION: THE ART OF GOVERNMENT SURVIVAL</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A Mixed Planning Model</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Administration</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Implementation</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Footnotes to Chapter 16</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table of Contents continued

**TABLES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Existing and Presently Proposed Hierarchy of Service Centres in Zimbabwe</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Revised Hierarchy of Service Centres in Zimbabwe</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Costs of Whitsun Proposal and of the Proposed Alternate for Urban Places in the TTLs</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Illustrative Table Comparing Efficiencies in Crop Marketing</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Implementation: likely sequence</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**FIGURES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>FIGURE</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>New Periodic Market</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>Developing Periodic Market</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>III</td>
<td>Regulated Market Society</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Diagram Illustrating the Functions of and Relations Between the Central Union (or Agency) and Village Co-operatives</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>Village Milk Co-Op Society</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Proposed Education System</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Health System</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>The Administration of Rights and of the Public Interest</td>
<td>164</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Planning, A Mixed System Viewed as a Continuum</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>Community Land Company</td>
<td>183</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**MAPS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>MAP</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>Rural Service Centres: An Example as Proposed in the Whitsun Report</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>II</td>
<td>Altered Proposal Showing Periodic Sub-System Based Upon Chinyika</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 9

THE UTILITY OF A COMBINED PERIODIC SERVICE AND REGULATED MARKET SYSTEM IN THE DEVELOPMENT OF ECONOMIC HINTERLANDS: THE CASE OF ZIMBABWE'S TRIBAL TRUST LANDS

Spatial planners have made their contribution to development planning within the economic growth paradigm which held that growth would most readily result from industrialisation and that rapid industrialisation would most naturally be accommodated in a few metropolitan centres from where its benefits would 'spread'. Planning for the objective of economic growth via industrialisation and urbanisation was seen as a central technical function characterised by econometric modelling allied to sophisticated administration.

Spatial planners added a concern for spatial equity and integration, proposing an ordering of promoted activities at urban, regional and national levels. Their principal contribution has been the notion of growth poles and growth centres.¹

In recent years the economic growth paradigm has been questioned and new approaches proposed. Qualitative judgements rather than quantitative techniques have gained the centre of the planning stage. Development is seen as based on social development with a prime focus on basic needs.²

This chapter reviews a recent proposal, along the lines of central place theory, to build Rural Service Centres (RSC) in Zimbabwe's Tribal Trust Lands. It concludes that a less concrete, more organic approach would promise not only greater returns to physical investment but would provide the outline to a more integrated approach to the provision of services, to local market development and regional specialisation, and to community expression and functioning.

The Proposal

The Tribal Trust Lands of Zimbabwe represent poorly developed spatial configurations with weak links into the urban place hierarchy of the country. They are typically served by small business centres most of which do not
reach the size used to define rural service centres. The Whitsun Foundation Rural Service Centres Development Study estimates that there are some 2,500 such business centres. The great majority of Zimbabwe’s numerous small business centres in the countryside exist at some distance from the relatively few developed urban centres. The Whitsun report identified a serious lacuna in the structure of urban places which exists between the large number of small business centres and the 20 or so proposed small towns included in the Integrated Plan for Rural Development of 1978. The Whitsun report recommends the creation of 300 Rural Service Centres (RSCs) some 15 to 20 kilometres apart, each one serving a population of between 5,000 and 15,000. None of the 300 proposed centres are in areas where the population density drops below 15 per square kilometre. It is believed that the 300 RSCs would cater to over 80% of the population living in the more densely settled half (56%) of the Tribal Trust Lands. Each RSC would cost 400,000 dollars and require the raising of local revenues to sustain annual recurrent costs of about 50,000 dollars. The proposal estimates that some 40 to 45 jobs would be created at each RSC or a total of some 13,000 in the country.

The study admits that it has adopted an abstract statistical method. The actual number of rural service centres required could vary from 275 to 320. The study acknowledges that, by limiting RSCs to areas with more than 15 persons per square kilometre it has ignored some 46% of the Tribal Trust Lands with low density populations which hold approximately 20% of the population. It argues that a different approach is required for these areas.

The Whitsun study develops a static framework - Central Place Theory and spatial and numerical standards derived from the existing situation - as the basis for changing the future. Central Place Theory provides little insight into processes of spatial economic development. The static, inflexible framework adopted may constrain rather than promote development in the medium to long term. The study does not explore the relationship between the distribution of power and wealth in Zimbabwe and the lopsided urban spatial structure. The maldistribution is reflected in the absence of medium and small size towns; a factor which investment in towns by itself may not correct. This weakness is further revealed in a belief that the universal aspects of the urbanisation process are a
sufficient basis upon which to launch a successful RSC programme. As a result the study relies on Christaller's abstract geometric solution for the optimum location of central places as the basis for the spatial pattern of RSCs. The appropriateness of the assumptions underlying Christaller's Central Place Theory are not explored. The peculiar history of Zimbabwe's development does suggest that a more particular view of the structural problems which exist in the urban hierarchy and of rural dependence is needed.

The result, flowing from the simple adoption of Christaller's theory, is that three assumptions are included which may be at variance with the requirement of the situation in Zimbabwe. These are:

1. production costs (of services) are constant over a uniform plane,
2. consumers (demand) are evenly distributed,
3. each type of service has its own net of hexagons (market/service areas) with one production unit located in the centre of each hexagon so as to monopolise the largest number of consumers.

An alternate approach to that of market/service area would be to minimise costs. Such an approach would reverse assumptions (1) and (2) above. It would not lead to an a priori pattern of centres.

The static framework raises several queries. The first is the likelihood that many centres would not call forth the activity required to support them. The second question is the ability of the RSCs, as proposed, to adapt. For instance, increased income and mobility in the hinterland of a RSC, however brought about, might invalidate the numerical and spatial standards adopted if it led to people by-passing the local RSC for another town.

Government will no doubt introduce investment of this type in a phased manner. The IRDA-1 project document advises a cautionary learning-by-doing approach. The high capital requirements of RSCs and the risks inherent in the programme as proposed suggests that caution will be exercised, at least in the sense that fewer and more obvious centres will be developed in the first phase. That phase itself may turn out to be of a longer duration than fits with the desire to bring the Tribal
Trust Lands further into the national service and market system. A more flexible, less costly and less formal approach appears to be needed. Ideally, such an approach would also serve the 46% of the Tribal Trust Lands excluded in the Whitsun proposal.

The Grain Marketing Board and the Cotton Marketing Board have both proposed the opening of seasonal depots in the Tribal Trust Lands at levels above the RSCs. At the same time it appears that the so-called 'approved buyer system' is likely to be expanded along with renewed co-operative effort. The Agricultural Marketing Authority intends to license more than one agent in every business centre so as to ensure competition in the procurement of regulated crops. These moves represent an extension of official marketing of regulated crops further down the scale of production. Government have also announced that they will reintroduce the idea of an equalisation of transport costs so that prices paid at depots throughout the country will be equal or nearly equal.

Attempts to equal or nearly equal farm gate prices have been tried in the past in Rhodesia and elsewhere. Experience suggests that, as an isolated policy, it can lead to serious distortions in the spatial distribution of production and in resource use, and to higher overall production costs. Equalisation measures are more acceptable if used as tactics within regional programmes.

In Zimbabwe there is an immediate short-term need to stimulate activity in the tribal areas and for Government to be seen to be redressing the old balance which operated in favour of white farmers. Can short-term stimulation be achieved without leading to distortions in the longer run that may cancel the value of the initial impetus? For instance, the country is capable of producing more maize than is needed for the domestic market. What pricing policies would attract maize production sufficient for the domestic and available export markets while also encouraging a growing degree of regional specialisation in the labour intensive, higher value cash crops, such as cotton and tobacco, that have stronger industrial and export market linkages? Schemes, such as the Transport Equalization Fund of old and the monopoly extraction of regulated crops from the TTLs would appear to contain serious contradictions in terms of both national agricultural production policy and of the role of local market growth in regional development.
The growth of the co-operative movement in the 1960s and early 1970s did promise to bring small remote producers into closer contact with the national market and upon more favourable terms. Producer involvement in decision making, group participation and a greater degree of self-determination did and still can produce tangible results in the form of better understanding of market requirements, more careful grading and bagging, cheaper transport and handling, and greater autonomy in member relations with the storekeepers-cum-agents. Regional and national federations of farmer co-operatives are capable of wielding strong negotiating cards in dealing with the central marketing bodies. In fact, they can offer to relieve agencies such as the Grain Marketing Board of functions it performs at high cost: local administration of numerous trader/agents, the handling of payments to members, local storage and investment in local infrastructure.

The rejuvenation of the co-operative movement will take some time, certainly before it covers the majority of farmers in the Tribal Trust Lands. The room for co-operative endeavour allowed by the arrangements governing the RSCs and the official market structures may well be a vital factor in the growth and effectiveness of the co-operative movement. Strong co-operatives can, in turn, play a crucial role in the development of regional specialisation in accord with spatial, agronomic and market conditions.

A Counter Proposal: a Periodic System with Regulated Market Societies

The development of an urban infrastructure in the TTLs has to be capable of meeting several requirements, some of which conflict and all of which change over time. In essence, it has to be able to fill gaps in the provision of services whilst allowing and being able to respond to local factors, initiatives and transformations. What follows is an adaptation of growth centre, periodic market and regulated market concepts. It is designed to offer a least cost, flexible and locally responsive approach to the development of urban centres in the Tribal Trust Lands.

Periodic market systems have existed in Europe in earlier times and are still today a major feature of large parts of east and south Asia, of West Africa and of South America. Their utility is that they provide a regular focal point, usually within walking distance, for local marketing and service transactions within a system of hierarchic arrangements. A
series of weekly or biweekly markets, operating for a half or whole day, take place in 'a ring' around a central place. Invariably the timing of each market fits within a logical pattern of local activity and of linkages to the central place. The effect is to concentrate the economic and service requirements of remote, small and usually poor communities so that economies of scale are achieved for households and for merchants, official agents, co-operatives and government services. As markets grow or decline, so the periodicity with which they operate increases or reduces.

A regulated market denotes the constitution of a local society which holds open auctions of agricultural produce. Regulated Market Societies would normally operate within a legal framework provided by government and be fitted into a system of official agricultural pricing. They are often created with more than one aim in mind. Aims could be one or more of the following:

1. To encourage small producers to participate in the sale of surpluses by providing an open auction forum in which groups of fellow producers can participate with a greater degree of confidence in the prices ruling at the time, than they can dealing with traders.

2. Allied to the first aim is a subsidiary proposition which is that producers in debt to traders may be at a disadvantage when it comes to selling surpluses through the same trader, particularly when some or all of that produce is to pay interest charges or redeem part of the principal of a loan.

3. Conducting open auctions at local levels does bring farmers into contact with wider market trends and is therefore an educational process. Most research has found farmers to be generally well informed about prices prevailing in nearby areas, but that this is dependent in large part upon their physical access to markets.\textsuperscript{10}

4. The channelling of local agricultural surpluses through a local institution provides for the development of local governance as well as a point in the movement of goods at which a local levy can be easily and equitably applied.\textsuperscript{11} Regulated market committees are therefore potentially powerful bodies able to raise relatively large local resources which can be utilised in the development of local
infrastructure and services. Where Regulated Market Societies exist under law, their operation would be supervised and audited by a Registrar. That, as with other registrars, is intended to add confidence to the community in the operation of the auction as well as in the utilisation of the funds raised.

The design of spatial arrangements and service provision in the Tribal Trust Lands has to accommodate a variety of subsistence and market orientated conditions. On the majority of tribal farms the return to labour rather than to land is the measure of performance because they are predominantly subsistence operations. The bulk of farmers are small and with limited resources. The size of the household may well be the prime determinant of the size of the holding worked. In that case production per unit of the land may be taken as far as possible even if in contrast to spatial considerations. In some areas, mainly because of the growing population pressure and perhaps because of more developed markets and services, the return to land rather than labour will be the key issue in farm management. The larger, better off and better serviced farmers may reflect spatial relations more exactly. As improved service and market arrangements are made, so the primary importance of the size of the household should begin to decline in favour of returns to land. As that happens spatial considerations become more prominent. How effective this transformation will be is dependent upon many factors, in particular the form and the flexibility of land tenure systems, the growth of local institutions and government, and settlement and trade patterns. Most agricultural intensification schemes in Africa have failed. Agricultural growth has tended to follow from the expansion of acreage, not yields. In Zimbabwe's Tribal Trust Lands there is little room for the expansion of cultivation. Agricultural intensification has to succeed. It is in this light that proposals for the development of urban infrastructure in the Tribal Trust Lands must be judged.

Despite the caveats entered above, it is likely that in every region a scale of functional hierarchy can be observed. That hierarchy would explain and underline the settlement hierarchy. A series of major studies conducted in the 1960s and 1970s in India, which in many ways reflects conditions in Africa, showed that for different services and levels of services people exhibit 'space preferences'. This is of
course as it should be. However, in India it was found that the lower order services involved little interaction beyond peoples' own village. For nonubiquitous or complex services people will travel quite substantial distances. For instance, the studies revealed that poor farmers travel frequently over short distances using poor methods of transport to achieve single purposes. In contrast, wealthier farmers travel less frequently but further using better means of transport to achieve a number of purposes. The poor spend more time to service their farm operations and their personal and family needs than do the rich. In those parts of India where periodic markets exist it was noted that villagers tended to combine other interactions with that associated with the weekly market.

The picture that emerges from the Indian studies suggests that the recent tendency to locate all important rural institutions at the headquarters or central place needs to be examined. The frequency with which villagers visited the central place ranged from 0 to 5 times a year. Even the best of the farmers did not travel to the central place more than 4 or 5 times a year. The central place was visited in order to sell agricultural surpluses, to attend court cases or to arrange for agricultural loans or inputs. The more striking fact was that the great majority of villagers did not visit the central place in the course of the year. In contrast, villagers visited nearby weekly markets at an average of 52 times a year.

The Indian findings are not only dramatic, they suggest that efficiencies of scale are more likely to be realised at the village neighbourhood level rather than at the central place. They are surely of great interest to Zimbabwe. They serve to raise the question whether it would not be advisable to try to create a network of rural institutions based on, amongst other things, a pattern of distribution of weekly markets in a periodic system.

To raise the place and the role of periodic market systems in Zimbabwe is to demand that the temporal element be added to the spatial component. The former is ignored in the Whitsun study. In the scheme proposed, the temporal element would provide much of the initial dynamic to urban development.
The Indian and some of the West African material on rural services and markets suggests that a further component has to be included in the design of urban centres in the countryside.\textsuperscript{14} That is the importance of local leadership, however informal. The success of local leadership adds an element of acceptability to the services and institutions at all centres which is as important as their spatial or accessibility factor. Informal leaders play the role of communicators through which others in their neighbourhood are brought to face and accept change. In other words there is a social network in the countryside which is very strong and which is rarely absent in any village or across any space. While the leaders and their followers will vary from place to place, the pattern will have common themes.

Some may object that local leadership, if given its rein, may develop its exploitative character. While this is a difficult field on which to comment in the abstract, it can be stated that local leadership can be more or less valuable, in general dependent largely upon the nature of the institutions through which it works. Elsewhere we have argued for strong democratic foundations and for more explicit economic rights based upon Community Land Companies, in local institutions such as Credit Unions and upon programmes which support the weaker individuals while infusing capital into the countryside, such as an Employment Guarantee Scheme. Given that backdrop to the design of rural development, it should be possible to proceed with some confidence in the design of institutions which would enhance the role play of informal local leadership at the level of weekly periodic markets. In theoretical terms it would acknowledge that a formalisation of spatial patterns of interaction is encouraged by the demarcation and use of political, institutional and administrative zones within which much interaction takes place. Also that there already exists a social organisation that both binds and separates groups of people and which affects if not determines the nature of the relationships between them. In short the design of urban centres in the countryside has to fit within institutional and programme approaches, particularly as these determine the level at which decisions are made. It is also important to recognise that the interaction between villages is as important as that between the village and its adjacent metropolis.
The last point can be illustrated by comparing the recommendations of the Whitsun report for Zimbabwe with actual conditions in the tribal belt across central India. The Whitsun report recommends the creation of rural service centres serving a population of between 5,000 and 15,000. This is in the more densely settled parts of the Tribal Trust Lands. In central India some 7 to 10 villages with approximately 7,000 people are served by a central place which itself has a population of between 1,500 to 2,500: the focal point with its sub-system of periodic markets comprises somewhere between 8,000 to 11,000 people. In other words a sub-system on the lowest order of settlement in the hierarchy which contains approximately half the number of people proposed to be served by rural service centres in Zimbabwe. Added to that is the fact that of the 7 to 10 villages in the 'ring', a majority of villages would have on one day a week a periodic market operating in that village which was well attended by people from that village and surrounding villages.

In planning terms, the creation of larger socio-economic and political spaces than that of the single village.

The knowledge gained by recent research into the temporal arrangements of the countryside in India suggests that most villagers can conduct the great majority of their transactions in a weekly market which takes place either in or within close walking distance of their own village. The task which planners have now embarked upon in India is to utilise that very local and intimate sub-system around the lower order settlements to bring administrative and other services close to villagers. Because the economic base of an urban centre changes over time, it is a poor predictor of urban growth. Long-run urban growth, it has been argued, is more a function of the service sector than of basic activities. In particular, a competitive service sector enables urban centres to replace stagnating basic activities with vigorous new ones.

We may now pose the question, whether there is a natural progression in the determination of spatial and temporal relations in the countryside? Is it necessarily the only correct procedure to invest in rural service centres that by the present standard of many other parts of the world are higher order centres, or is it possible to embark upon a dual programme which develops both higher order centres and sub-systems which radiate out from
them in the form of a 'ring'? The question can be answered in large part only in terms of the nature of the institutions and programmes that government intends to promote in any one area. Nonetheless, experience elsewhere suggests that the mechanical development of rural service centres has to be questioned and that a richer complex of higher and lower order settlements together with sub-systems of a periodic market system promises to be altogether more effective.

It is now possible to reorder the Whitsun proposal in certain directions. Before doing so we must take note of the proposal contained in THE INTEGRATED PLAN FOR RURAL DEVELOPMENT prepared under the last government. The plan listed twenty potential 'growth points' for the first ten year planning period. These 'growth points' are towns designed to fall within a so-called middle or lower level of the urban hierarchy with populations of between 2 500 and 25 000 people. The plan estimates that each town's infrastructural cost will total 600 000 dollars at 1977 costs. Each town is planned to consist of 1 000 residential and 100 commercial units. The definition of a growth point includes the basic functions contained in the rural service centre together with more specialised functions, especially those of manufacturing and processing. The proposed twenty 'growth points' are shown in Table 1. The table shows the hierarchy of service centres in Zimbabwe according to the 1969 census figures. The Whitsun proposal is to add 300 more service centres as the lowest level of settlement to the present hierarchy. Below that are the 2 000 odd business centres scattered through the Tribal Trust Lands.

The failure of growth centre policies to generate significant spread effects to lagging hinterlands has been noted by several authorities. Indeed, Benjamin Higgins has asked if development poles exist, that is cases where investment in manufacturing, perhaps with government subsidies, or in infrastructure or in both attracts propulsive industries to a particular urban centre, with these industries solving the problems of the retarded region by generating spread effects'. Higgins points out that there may be a conflict between the goal of accelerating national growth and the goal of improving the urban structure. Certainly, growth centre policies can introduce an infrastructure bias which shifts attention away from critical health, education, market and other services
### TABLE 1

Existing and Presently Proposed Hierarchy of Service Centres in Zimbabwe

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Number of Centres</th>
<th>Mean Population</th>
<th>Mean number of Central Functions</th>
<th>Mean number of Functional Units</th>
<th>Mean Distance between Centres kms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Present</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>386,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>245,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>36,000</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>504</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>16,000</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8,000</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6,000</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>3,000</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>108(100)</td>
<td>1,500</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business Centres</td>
<td>2400+</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>&gt;20</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proposed Investment in 'Growth Points'</td>
<td>2-5</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>2,500-25,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>&lt;50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>RSC</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>&lt;20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. 100 Grade 1 centres are in, though poorly distributed over, the Tribal Trust Lands. Source: Figures from 1969 Census. Table derived from Whitsun report, Table 3, p.44

In their hinterlands. Hansen argues that the general failure has placed the burden of proof in the efficacy of growth centre policies upon its supporters. Higgins prefers to see the emergence of central places as historical accidents, as the result of natural resource exploitation, agriculture, forestry or mining, which generates the growth that, at first, is able to sustain an urban centre. Lefeber is more explicit. He demands that, in the case of retarded regions and pockets of unemployment distant from industrial centres, the first planned effort must concentrate on the upgrading of agriculture.
The revised proposal which appears below excludes the twenty 'growth points' proposed for Zimbabwe. Instead, it is proposed that policy and investment concentrate on lower order centres and in more suitable institutional and political choices for the countryside. That should generate the rural economy and the mechanisms needed to sustain growth points of the size envisaged as a natural outgrowth of more active hinterlands.

Table 2 shows the revision of table 1 utilising the periodic market concept. Revision is in two directions. The twenty growth points are replaced by an increase in the number of grade 1 settlements. This is so because most are in the Tribal Trust Land and therefore can act as central places to a periodic sub-system.

Each grade 1 centre could support ten to twenty periodic markets organised in two or more rings about the central place. Half the number of proposed rural service centres, each together with a periodic sub-system or on average ten daily markets in two rings, would raise the total number of market-cum-service centres in the Tribal Trust Lands from the 400 proposed (grade 1 plus RSC), to 3080, 280 (grade 1 plus RSC) plus 2800 (periodic markets), almost a seven-fold increase in the number of centres. Since this pattern would suit both the high and the low density areas of the TTLs, it represents an order of increase in the high population density areas of about four times that proposed. In other words, a revision of the basic service area, that of the RSC as proposed, from about 220 sq.kms. to 400 sq. kms., to a service area per periodic market of 16 sq. kms. to 25 sq. kms. A greater distance between RSCs would result, from 15 to 20 kms. as proposed to about 20 to 30 kms. in the more densely settled half and from 30 to 50 kms. in the less densely settled half of the TTLs. Instead, all villagers would be brought into more intimate contact with periodic markets. For many villagers a market, with services, would operate in or near their village at least once a week. Moreover, on a further three to four days a week markets would operate in neighbouring villages within 5 kms. in the more densely settled half or within 8 kms. in the less densely settled half of the Tribal Trust Lands. Contact with markets and services should rise from a few times a year in the case of RSCs to weekly or more frequent contact in the case of a periodic sub-system.
TABLE 2

Revised Hierarchy of Service Centres in Zimbabwe

Grades 8 - 2 as in Table 1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Number of Centres</th>
<th>Mean Population</th>
<th>Mean number of Functional Units</th>
<th>Mean distance between Centres kms.</th>
<th>Service Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 RSC</td>
<td>138 (130) (^2)</td>
<td>1 500</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>(20-30) (^3) (30-50)</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>150</td>
<td>1 000</td>
<td>&lt;20</td>
<td></td>
<td>7-20 000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Periodic Markets</td>
<td>2 800</td>
<td>40-120</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4 (^4) (8)</td>
<td>1 700-3 200</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. The table takes no account of the 20 proposed 'growth centres'. It is being argued that investment of this nature be deferred.

2. 130 in the TTLs.

3. 20-30 kms in the more densely settled and 30-50 kms in the less densely settled halves of the TTLs.

4. 5 kms apart in more densely settled and 8 kms apart in the less densely settled halves of the TTLs.

TABLE 3

Costs of Whitsun Proposal and of the Proposed Alternate for Urban Places in the TTLs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Cost in $100,000</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Whitsun Report</td>
<td>300 RSCs at $400,000 = $120,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternate Proposed</td>
<td>30 Grade 1 at $800,000 = $24,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>150 RSCs at $500,000 = $75,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2 800 Periodic at $10,000 = $28,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong> = $127,000,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Jobs Created:

Whitsun: full-time RSCs 40-45 per RSC total 13,000
Alternate: full-time 30 Grade 1 at 70 jobs = 2,100
150 RSCs at 50 jobs = 7,500

part-time: 2 800 periodic markets at 25-50 9,600

1. Plus, cost of proposed twenty Growth Centres, $12,000,000. This investment in rural development strategy to be deferred in favour of more direct investment in rural development - infrastructure, institutions, services and markets.
Maps I and II provide a visual comparison between the RSC structure proposed in the Whitsun report and the alternate periodic sub-system proposed herein. In Map I four existing business centres are upgraded to RSCs, one new site becomes a RSC and the remaining sixteen business centres stay as they are. In Map II, only two existing business centres are upgraded to RSCs. Radiating out from these and from Gutu town are several periodic market rings. The map illustrates the two rings emanating from Chinyika RSC; in all thirteen market sites which operate from half a day to two full days per week. A number of periodic markets arise outside of any existing business site.

In Map II a four tier system comprised of 39 sites is illustrated. Figure 1 portrays the evolution of a periodic market site brought into being by the delivery of services for a particular period each week into an increasingly permanent market site with a Regulated Market Society reinvesting its income from rents, levies and profits in the further development of the market and services.

Zimbabwe is busy reinstating and extending the coverage of rural services built up before the disruption of the last few years. The concept of RSCs will help to discipline the siting of services and the housing for service personnel into fewer urban sites with, therefore, greater growth and service potential. The temporal aspect and the more intimate physical character of a periodic sub-system should lead to other equally important efficiencies. For instance, in the few areas where the full physical health care plan is in place, clinics are still 11 kms. or so apart. They serve a population of between 2,000 to 5,000. The clinics are fed by village health workers serving an area with an 8 km. radius and a population of between 200 - 500. That infrastructure can be incorporated into a periodic sub-system with the benefit that on at least one day a week higher level medical personnel would attend clinics in a nearby market place at which large numbers of people from neighbouring villages congregated. Real savings in terms of travel and of accomplishment per visit by personnel and patients can be effected.

The same would hold true for agricultural and veterinary extension, bank, postal, mobile library, adult education and commercial services. At
MAP I  Rural Service Centres: An Example as Proposed

in the Whitsun Report (p. 68).

KEY:
- EXISTING BUSINESS CENTRES
- RURAL SERVICE CENTRES

AS PROPOSED TOWN X 1
- 5 RURAL SERVICE CENTRES
- 1: EXISTING BUSINESS CENTRES
- 2 TOTAL
MAP II. Altered Proposal Showing Periodic Sub-System Based

Upon Chinyika

CHINYKA'S 13 UNIT SUBSYSTEM
RURAL SERVICE CENTRE 1
REGULATED MARKET SOCIETIES 4
PERIODIC MARKETS 9

SERVICING TIMES
M Z
T Z
W Z
W 1
M 1
T 2
M 1
F 2
F 1
S 2

KEY:
M = MON. AM
M = MON. PM

KEY: O PERIODIC MARKET AT EXISTING BUSINESS CENTRES
O NEW PERIODIC MARKET
O REGULATED MARKET SOCIETY
O RURAL SERVICE CENTRE

ALTERED PROPOSAL

TOWN X 1

2 RURAL SERVICE CENTRES
10 REGULATED MARKET SOCIETIES
26 PERIODIC MARKETS
39 TOTAL
NEW PERIODIC MARKET

INFORMAL MARKET SOCIETY

WC. & DRINKING WATER

SERVICES ON WHEELS
  HEALTH, POST OFFICE,
  AGRICULTURE.

TRADERS ON FOOT (MOSTLY WOMEN)
  BUTCHER (ILLEGAL)

DEVELOPING PERIODIC MARKET

REGULATED MARKET SOCIETY
  PRIMITIVE AUCTION SHED & TRUCK

MARKET PLACE
  STALLS FOR RENT
  MEAT SELLING (LEGAL)

SERVICES ON WHEELS
  HEALTH, POST OFFICE

SHOPS & STORES
  + BAKER, TAYLOR

REGULATED MARKET SOCIETY

REGULATED MARKET SOCIETY
  AUCTION FLOOR INSIDE SHED, TRUCKS
  OIL PROCESSOR

MARKET PLACE
  PERMANENT SHOPS & STALLS
  BAKER, BUTCHER

CLINIC - OWN BUILDING
HALL - FOR CHURCH, SCHOOL ETC
FARM CO-OP - STORE ROOMS,
  CREDIT WINDOW ETC
ANIMAL SELLING YARD - SHADE, FENCE
RESIDENCES FOR SOME PERMANENT
  FAMILIES.
present the ideal, though still a distant hope, is that agricultural

demonstrators serve, by bicycle, an area not exceeding 10 kms. in radius,
or a maximum population of from 5 000 to 12 000, or one staff member

for from roughly 1 000 to 2,400 farmers. Congregating farmers at several

periodic markets on different days of the week within the area served by
one agricultural demonstrator means that he can contact through demon-

strations, lectures and films a large number of farmers each week (depending

don the seasonal requirements of extension) and that this efficiency can

warrant his regular support by specialists and the use of specially

prepared media. RSCs, conversely, because they are higher yield order

centres, are suited to occasional, region wide events such as agricultural

shows, meetings of the CSO Board and of Master Farmer committees and the

like.

Table 3 illustrates the costs of the altered hierarchy of service centres

proposed. While very rough, the table does suggest that it would be

possible, on cost grounds, to achieve a fairly universal coverage in the

Tribal Trust Lands for about what it would cost to implement the Whitsun

proposal. The cost of a rural service centre has been increased 25% to

include additional facilities and residences in order to cater to its

hinterland of periodic markets. As we shall see, those periodic markets

and those rural service centres that institute and operate a Regulated

Market Society would be able to finance the development of their market

and its related infrastructure. In other words, much of the cost of

developing the periodic markets could be financed by means of loans.

Table 3 also compares the jobs created under the two proposals. The

significant difference is in the very large number of part-time jobs

provided in the periodic markets. It means that many villagers will gain

worker, artisan, manager or specialist status and experience - an invest-

ment in the leading edge of development, human capital.

The Working of Periodic Markets

A periodic market can operate in a clearing, preferably under shade trees.

It would normally be situated near a village and adjacent to a cross roads

and a bus stop. In Zimbabwe it would almost certainly take place in an

existing business, mission or school or in a combination of such sites.
The impetus for the institution of periodic markets would have to come from government working with local leaders and institutions. The following list of services that would operate in a developed periodic market illustrates the combination of official, local institutional and commercial elements that would bring its periodicity to life.

**Local Institutions** - weekly, monthly or seasonal meetings of:
- Community Land Company
- Credit Union
- Regulated Market Society
- Agricultural Co-operative
- Church Committees
- School Committees
- Health Committees

**Official Agencies** - mobile offices or weekly opening of:
- Post Office
- Primary Health Centre
- Agricultural Extension
- Adult Education (perhaps under Employment Guarantee Scheme)
- Animal Husbandry; including the management of dip tanks and livestock auctions (these could be administered by the market or a co-operative society)
- Mobile Library

**Commercial:**
- Existing store or stores
- Butcher (often open only once or twice a week in a Tribal Trust Land)
- Baker (a rural bakery becomes profitable under periodic market systems. It can serve two or three nearby markets from one bakery, i.e. it can operate three to four times a week)
- Grinding mill (can be mobile)
- Visiting traders
- Open vegetable and fruit, second hand and locally fabricated goods market usually manned by petty traders operating in a circuit and by local villagers, mostly women
- Mobile cinema, theatre, other entertainment, some officially sponsored for educational purposes
Barber
Tailor
Shoe repairer
Potter
Herbalist.

It may help to illustrate the working of a periodic market system with an account of the way they operate in West Africa. Periodic markets take place in a 'ring' among a group of villages. The markets are usually over 4 or 8 day periods with the market in one part of the area each day. The distribution of markets is such that every market area, or ring, has four or eight market meeting places. In West Africa markets take place in easily accessible areas though they are usually away from any village. This is probably the result of traditional rivalry among the people of the area so that they chose to meet and trade on mutual ground. This fact may also explain the dominance of women in local trade, probably, at least initially, because it avoided the possibility of arguments among men. Each market is usually 11 kms. away from the other and there is usually a higher level town or village at the centre of the market area. A central village usually has a daily market which buys much of the surplus production from the market area and also supplies local women with goods imported into the area. Women from the central village take the goods to the periodic market and sell them there, often in return for local produce which they then resell at the daily market. Local women often travel to more than one market during the four or eight day period. This is because they often cannot carry all their produce to market (most travel is by foot) and many products are liable to perish if not used within a day or two.

The periodic markets are highly efficient with most of an area's population partaking in the trade. Goods aimed at markets outside the local area are bulked by part-time local traders in touch with intermediaries. Such goods may by-pass the periodic market and go straight into the larger central town or village. In other words, the periodic market, once every four or eight days, brings most of the adults of a locality into contact with intermediaries from the larger area. Local produce is traded and if the price is lower than the expected price in other areas (indicating a surplus)
the produce is bought in bulk by the intermediaries and sold in other areas. Such 'export' trade provides revenue which can be used to purchase farm inputs and other goods brought into the local area, usually by the same or other intermediaries. The system is both labour intensive and efficient with the government's role kept to a minimum.

It is recommended that in Zimbabwe each periodic market be managed by an elected committee. The committee could receive a small amount of initial support from government in the form of a low interest loan to set out the market, including the provision of pit latrines and drinking water where necessary. The committee should enjoy the legal rights to charge a small fee from those who use the facilities to trade. It should be encouraged to take loans with which to erect covered spaces, storage, a meeting hall and even shops; whatever will encourage the growth of the market and thereby the business turnover and the comfort and effectiveness of social and other services.

The Regulated Market Society

Market committees should be able to register, perhaps with a special registrar, as Regulated Market Societies. A 'regulated' market in this context means a physical market area in which agricultural produce is auctioned. The principle is to open up the selling and buying of agricultural produce, primarily with the major staples, cash crops and livestock within a locally controlled and understood market. Open market mechanisms act to encourage peasant production for the market for the mechanism of sale is verbal and open to checks by neighbours, the elected Market Committee and auditors. It removes producer reliance on traders, including official agents, with whom producers may have other and dependent relations. For instance, a trader can play upon the prices he offers for produce in settlement of debt or when he knows that the seller relies upon him for credit in emergencies.

A significant degree of efficiency is effected by the temporal discipline of auctions. Under the trader/agent scheme crop deliveries take place on any day and tend to be in the form of small exchanges for immediate consumption needs. In contrast, a Regulated Market Society would hold a limited number of auctions after harvest time, as decided by the members.
The greater volume of deliveries on any one day allows for greater efficiencies in terms of handling, storage and transport. Consequently, as shown below, the Society should be able to translate official prices for produce delivered at depots into a support price offered by the Society, which includes transport on society account, that is appreciably above the price offered by traders/agents.

Table 4 Illustrative Table Comparing Efficiencies in Crop Marketing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>GMB Depot Price</th>
<th>Trader/Agent</th>
<th>Regulated Market Society</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>100</td>
<td>deductions for:</td>
<td>deductions for:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>handling 19.4%</td>
<td>levy 8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>transport 8.3%</td>
<td>transport 6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>net price 100</td>
<td>net price 100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- 27.7</td>
<td>- 14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>official price 72.3</td>
<td>support price 86</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Hypothetical figures, the levy, at 8%, is 2% above the maximum levy on wheat allowed in the Punjab, India. The transport, 6%, reflects expected efficiencies from bulk haulage.

The translation of official depot prices into a support price at auctions conducted by Regulated Market Societies has several benefits. It removes the management of countless petty details from the responsibility of the official agencies. It opens internal, and if so provided, export trade to the private sector who can capture business by bidding above the support price set by each society. It provides a strong economic incentive to co-operative effort which can spread to other agricultural, service and local processing ventures.

One of Tanzania's most successful development schemes has been the institution of cyclical cattle auctions which operate throughout the countryside. Called 'mada' the auctions were introduced in the 1950s as an acceptable form of encouraging destocking. Government acts as a buyer
of last resort, as in the regulated market system proposed, announcing the prices it is prepared to pay in advance. The auctions are especially prominent in the Masai region, notably Arusha district, where they have become important market events attracting large crowds. Party and administrative officials invariably travel to attend neighbouring auctions.\textsuperscript{28}

A Regulated Market Society system provides a source of local revenue raising which is controlled, set and the uses determined by members. Government, if thought desirable, can encourage local efforts by offers to match funds for particular purposes within laid down time limits. In similar fashion, banks and potential business partners, including CLCs, will vest in Societies whose membership is seen to be taxing itself for a better tomorrow. As with a tax on electricity consumption under a Community Electric Company,\textsuperscript{29} a levy on crop sales controlled by members of a Society is attractive on equity, efficiency and management grounds.

The operation of auctions need not preclude the retention of the trader/agent system. Society auctions should largely replace the trader/agent simply because, for at least some crops, it is able to generate efficiencies and group benefits from co-operative endeavours. Another benefit, though one to be more carefully husbanded, is that it helps to move the local economy onto a fuller cash basis. If that movement is supported by the thrift and especially the loan philosophy of local Credit Unions,\textsuperscript{30} then it can promise to help break onerous financial dependent ties. These combinations are becoming increasingly important as the nexus of poverty, unemployment and growing cash needs raises the price of money in the countryside.

In line with the above, Society sponsored storage and Credit Union loans to help farmers hold grains through periods of low prices post-harvest can mean that farmers do not have to lose considerable margins through distress sales and later re-purchases. It would help to even out local market fluctuations and to ensure that expected future local demand is held in the area; not, as at present, in a central depot.

Within the system of regulated market societies and periodic markets local people are offered a greater variety of seasonal, part-time and specialist roles within a close ambit. The intimate scale of operation, concentrated
both temporarily and spatially, means that the smaller members of local society can exert influence and can participate at the bottom end of a system that links local to regional and national markets. Most of the trade would be locally managed with little initial reliance on external goods and funds. It should be possible for a large variety of local people to utilise small savings as venture capital with which to embark upon new commercial occupations. However petty in the beginning, new occupations can benefit from the scale inherent in the temporal and physical mechanisms of the links between market and service hierarchies.

A properly integrated system of services, markets and local institutions should assist local traders to effect efficiencies of scale, including those attached to part-time or seasonal trade, and to move fairly rapidly from a concern for the pursuit of wider social goals to more narrowly economic ones. Local trade and the specialisation of production and services are more promising components of any strategy of regional development than is the present limited system of official purchase and monopoly removal of the surplus production of regulated crops.

A combination of the Regulated Market Society and the periodic market system does suggest that it is possible to nurture the growth of regional trade as a primary concern of development. To the degree that regional trade becomes a dominant reality, so it should represent a break in the dependency on the higher order urban areas that exists at present. With that should flow the beginnings of balanced development of the rural areas. At the same time the Regulated Market Societies and the periodic market system suggest a solution to the inflexibility in terms of both location and function of the rural service centres as proposed. Rather, it starts from the premise that growth centres and development poles can arise over time based on the development of service and market functions in a region exploiting natural resources. In that sense Christaller's central place theory is relevant, though it focuses on manufacturing rather than, as here, the earlier stages of services and markets. The proposal demands a change away from the conventional view that service and especially market functions are unsavoury activities which need to be carefully controlled and administered from the centre, to one which recognises their generative, productive, and skill and risk base within both a hierarchical and co-operative setting. Furthermore, popular participation and local determination are brought in as strong features at the initial stages of post-independent development.
FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER 9


3. A rural service centre should provide all essential retail, agricultural, community and government services to its hinterland - the hub of rural life. See Whitsun Foundation, Rural Service Centres Development Study, 1980, p.4.

4. Ibid.

5. Total cost $120 000 or $9 230 per job created.

6. This and the next paragraph are derived from comments on the study in a memorandum for DEVAG written by David Cott of the Department of Urban and Regional Planning, University of Cape Town, 25.8.80.


9. Rhodesia has experience from the 1960s in the form of the Transport Equalization Fund which reimbursed trader agents their costs but charged farmers in the TTDs uniformly for transport. The scheme benefitted farmers at a distance from markets and worked to penalise those well placed but who faced uniform charges higher than the cost of delivery. The latter, as is the case when it pays some to 'break the ring', stood to gain from illegal arrangements, which, being successful, ruined the financial structure of the equalization scheme. It is only when such a scheme is heavily subsidised that discipline can be maintained.


11. The members would determine the levy rates so as to cover costs and to leave a profit for local investment. Government could set a maximum, a minimum or both, but should do so only as stages in the furtherance of member education and society experience.

12. In most of Africa the size of the holding worked remains remarkably constant through periods of price and weather changes. The all-Africa figure is about one acre per person or two acres per labour unit. The pre-occupation with food crops and the limitation imposed by household size are the determinant factors. See, for instance, Carr, S., Rural Africana, Fall, 1971, and Boserup, E., The Conditions of Agricultural Growth, London, 1965.


15. Data from S. Wannali, op.cit.

16. There are similarities to John Friedman's 'agropolitan district', see his article 'Agropolitan Development', in UNCED, 1975, op.cit. pp.333-337.


25. These figures accord with the official plan to have a primary school within 5 kms. of rural homes.

26. Presumably, one must expect some existing business centres to enter a period of decline.

27. Description from Hodder, B.W. and Ukwu, U.I., Markets in West Africa, Ibadan University Press, 1969, pp.60-65. It is noteworthy that Hodder points to the fact that central place theory is probably not applicable to urban development in Yorubaland, Nigeria.

28. John Iliffe reports on the 'mnada' in his forthcoming 'History of Tanzania'.
29. See Chapter 12.

30. See Chapter 7.

31. In India and in West Africa village women often collect and sell vegetables once or twice a week to a local 'specialist', who bulks village goods into periodic markets. Between 5 a.m. and 7 a.m., or within a period of about one hour, village women can dispose of farm produce at points on inter-village paths less than two kilometres from home. The person bulking the vegetables will take two to four hours to purchase a head load and to dispose of it in the nearby market operating that day. Participation for most women is an extra rather than a competing activity.

32. Recent research indicates that African traders have high levels of economic motivation and ability. See, for instance, William O. Jones, 'Measuring the Effectiveness of Agricultural Marketing in Contributing to Economic Development: Some African Examples', Food Research Institute Studies, 9: pp.175-196, Stanford University.

33. Uma Lele has stressed the inappropriateness of the high minded desire to regulate trade and traders in her book, The Design of Rural Development, op.cit., and in writings on the foodgrain trade in India.
CO-OPERATIVE DAIRYING AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE SMALL MIXED FARM SECTOR

Dairying, or more particularly the cow, is the linchpin around which intensive mixed small scale agriculture is possible in many regions. Yet the almost complete dominance of dairying by whites operating large capital intensive farms and the paucity of local milk production and marketing in the black areas of the countryside are notable features of the sub-continent.

References to cattle in Africa inevitably include a set of rather puzzled statements centred on the vague term 'traditional values'. The natural ecology of much of southern Africa, grassland, makes the prevalent puzzlement odd. Historians and others have noted the state actions which have prevented Africans from remaining competitive with white farmers in the production of staple crops, milk and meat. Obvious note is made of the disastrous effects of the rinderpest and the east coast fever epidemics in the late 1890s and early 1900s, of the discriminatory legislation, particularly Dairy Control Boards and the like, that white farmers wrested from governments in the depression years of the 1920s and 1930s, and the removal of black farmers to overcrowded poorly endowed reserves. By 1930 in South Africa and by 1940 in Rhodesia, African agriculture was mired amidst land hunger, rural indebtedness, and a rapidly stratified society based initially on the maldistribution of livestock and subsequently of arable land. The search for wage employment swelled from that brief cataclysmic period, just before and soon after the turn of the century. In the search for wage employment blacks were prevented from entering normal urban and industrial life. At the same time they were unable to employ savings in productive investments in the countryside. The urban and the rural obstacles to black competition with whites trammelled early short-term forays into town into the inefficiencies and the degradations of the migrant labour system, a system which has played across the whole sub-continent.

The continued African involvement with cattle fits the fact of a preponderance of grassland in the sub-continent. Historically cattle, in a land abundant regime, served as security against drought, which affects crops more
directly, and as a stock of easily maintained capital. Milk and milk products formed a large part of the diet. Even in the dry winter months milk was common if not plentiful. Milk is an important supplement to the staples, maize and beans. Traditionally, visitors were always given milk to drink and presents were often of sour milk. A regular supply of fresh milk was important if the household were to enjoy a good 'maas' or yoghurt. Meat, from game and the ritual slaughter of cattle was available in large quantities roughly twice a month. It was distributed amongst the lineage, thus consolidating the group. Cattle, as lobola, underwrote marriage contracts.

Social and religious overlays almost certainly followed from the economic importance of cattle; particularly the use of cattle as a means of communication with the ancestors. Enormous emotional satisfaction was realised from the care of cattle, especially amongst the men but also with small boys who were given calves to look after.

Today the shortage of land combined with poor infrastructure, services and market arrangements compared to white farm areas means that in many regions cattle can perform neither the traditional extensive role nor can farmers adopt intensive commercial management on small holdings. The large private herds that remain, though a mere shadow of those a century ago, are mostly, with the partial exception of Botswana, in the hands of traditional or political office bearers. That, and the problems of overstocking and poor management on communal grazing lands has meant that the large herds do not serve as useful coat-tails upon which smaller neighbours can ride into more productive systems of cattle husbandry. Overall, the sizeable proportion of rural families without cattle, or with too few to partake in the efficient management of a commercial herd must act as a brake on any attempt to improve the environment of cattle management or to increase stock turnover. Earlier we have proposed the upgrading of traditional grazing rights into member shares over the asset, the grazing land, through the formation of CLCs. We now turn to consider dairying within the small farm sector.

Rural renewal has to be built upon the working out of conditions conducive to equity, security and participation, and to be fueled with economic
incentives to production. Occasionally, and for particular areas, a new
crop, usually for export, will succeed. Indeed agricultural success
in Africa has been almost entirely of this 'spontaneous' type. Coffee,
cotton and tobacco, supported by strong crop organisations, lie behind most
of the successes in East and Central Africa. South Africa has one counter-
part, the Small Cane Growers Association in Natal which is supported by the
sugar industry. More common is a picture of the failure of official efforts
in rural development. Many countries, most notably Lesotho, are littered
with abandoned agricultural projects sponsored by national and international
agencies that have left little behind except a peasantry more wary than ever
of official moves. There has been relatively little attention to the slow
accumulation of economic momentum that a programme approach, starting with
agrarian relations, promises. Most projects have been imposed pieces of
supposedly superior technology and organisation to that presently existing
locally.

The Keiskammahoek dairy project, the flagship of the Ciskei's agricultural
development, is such a project. It is a high technology, capital and
management intensive piece planted from above amidst a desperately poor and
socially broken society. A prime irrigation source is used to grow feed
crops for a pedigree herd rather than to supplement natural grazing by the far
larger cross-bred herd in the region. Tenants are quasi-employees of the
management on small plots upon which they oversee the grazing and milking of
a few cows currently in lactation on loan from the central farm. Jobs on
the scheme have cost almost the same to create as in South African industry
- R7 000. The tenants realise incomes that are less than semi-skilled wages
in factories though they gain the indirect benefits of housing and some food
crops, but all without security of tenure. The design consultants were
engaged to manage the project for the first five years. Officials talk
of the necessity of a second management contract as a foregone conclusion.

The Keiskammahoek project is overseen by a management committee comprised of
government, tribal authority and project management. There is also a
tenants' body which meets with management. The project could be put onto a
more acceptable basis if the tenants were given ownership, with the help of
a state loan, or control of the scheme under a lease from government. This
would enable them to appoint managers of the central farm and dairy, to
partake in profits,\textsuperscript{6} to enjoy greater security and to amend the rules. However, such democratic moves are unlikely as the whole is based on the maintenance of technology beyond the means of small participants. Even if that risk were taken, it would not resolve the fact that the scheme is poorly conceived in its regional setting.

At present the Keiskammahoek project enjoys official patronage under which false regulations and monopoly marketing arrangements set earlier to assist white producers are enforced by agricultural and health inspectors. This 'police action' helps to maintain an artificially limited supply of milk at a high price.\textsuperscript{7} Black and white pirate producers, who are unable to meet the regulations or to penetrate the monopoly arrangements, but who can undersell official milk, are hounded out of the market. 'Orderly marketing' is defended on the false grounds of eliminating the health hazards posed by the sale of 'illegal' milk. The frightful nutritional and health status of the Ciskei's population demands that the largest milk supply at the lowest price be encouraged - not the reverse. When conditions are as bad as they are, 45\% - 50\% of children die in their first few years due primarily to malnutrition,\textsuperscript{8} then the risks of 'illegal' milk appears trifling. As we shall see, there is no need for a system that makes cheap milk 'illegal'.

The present approach is in keeping with earlier attitudes under which white officials organised milk for rural schools, hospitals and administrative settlements in the Ciskei and Transkei from neighbouring white farms or from white managed government (or trust) farms in the reserves.

The result is twofold. The white designed and managed dairy project has to have a healthy balance sheet in order to keep official development flags flying. From available evidence, the project will not be able to pay a proper rate of interest on the capital expended and therefore not repay the capital itself. An impoverished peasantry,\textsuperscript{9} sitting on one of the great grassland tracts of southern Africa,\textsuperscript{10} and many living much closer to markets than is the project, is denied both the activity of commercial milk production as well as access to a cheap and plentiful milk supply. In no sense is the Keiskammahoek project a development scheme. It acts to the denial of regional development.
The grassland resource, a significant irrigation potential, the predominance of poor families heavily reliant on migrant labour, and nearby markets that are poorly served with milk is the set of opportunities and problems official moves in dairying should have addressed.

The issue goes far beyond the particulars of the Ciskei. Not simply because the general juxtaposition of grassland and rural poverty is common to the sub-continent. Rather, there are more directly pressing concerns with present milk production. In South Africa in recent years there has arisen a need to explore the desirability of a change in the scale, the capital intensity and perhaps even in the location of milk production. White, large scale milk production has become increasingly enmeshed in the complexity of artificially high feed prices following the zero sum game of controlled maize marketing, in particular. A refurbished black small scale mixed farm sector in areas close to large centres (Durban, East London, the Reef) could be more efficient at maintaining milch cattle. Bulk transport by rail or road may be economical over quite long distances. In India several cities are supplied daily by rail over distances in excess of two hundred miles.

In Zimbabwe there is a need to replace some of the milk produced for city consumption by white farmers with co-operative small-holder production. State farms may appear to offer immediate benefits in terms of replacement but could act to deny the small mixed farm sector access to a rich instrument of rural development.

The cow, after all, is a remarkable animal. For some 200 to 280 days per year she is in milk. Moreover, she produces two crops of milk a day, morning and evening. In factory terms, she returns her intake of food, fresh water, medication, shelter, love etc. within twelve hours. A poor farmer's present cow, while almost certainly a low milk producer, will respond to improved care. Moreover, every year the genetic material can be altered in the progeny by cross-breeding, usually most conveniently by A-I, so that potential milk and/or beef yields improve dramatically. Agricultural advice, training and services have the responsibility to see that the farmer's husbandry of the animals and the improved genetic quality of the herd keep in step. In other words, in a short period a farmer with a cow, however poor, can alter the value of his genetic stock considerably. Thereafter successive genetic
selection should aim at an optimum mixture of indigenous blood (resistance to disease, tolerance of poor physical and nutritional levels) with exotic stock (greater milk and or meat production, greater response to improved feed and management). Schemes under which young cross-bred cows in their first lactation are swapped for old indigenous cows between project management and farmers have the attraction of altering the income from milk of small farmers' overnight. It does run high risks, however, if no reliable support service, assurance of farmer understanding of the technology he has received or suitable marketing arrangements are as quickly instituted. Moreover, project bred and raised cross-bred cows carry many more direct costs than would farmer raised cows and it concentrates limited expertise away from farmer contact and education. The result is fewer cross-bred cows over time and greater financial costs to be borne by management or farmer. It also creates an 'us' and 'them' dichotomy which mitigates against farmer confidence that he can carry on the process. The trick, so to speak, the cross-bred cow, should be performed only when the requisite human, service and market infrastructure is being put into place.

What follows is a brief description of the steps and procedures that would lead to a co-operative dairy scheme comprised of a large number of small-scale producer members - most with from one to three cross-bred cows living around a series of milk collection points in the countryside. Together the members would own and be served by the latest in dairy plant controlled by the Union of the Co-operative Societies (see Figure 1) and by a full complement of professional managers, technicians and veterinarians.

In the first instance, it starts as a scheme promoted by an outside agency. Later new ventures can be promoted by existing dairy co-operatives through the Union. The steps are:

1. an analysis of milk markets, income, population and expenditure trends in a region;
2. investigation of likely supply areas in terms of existing dairying; present cattle type, uses of, numbers, and ownership distribution; grassland, pastures, water sources, crop residues and other available feeds; size and structure of farms;
3. Selection of a few communities along a transport route that enjoy greater relative potential in production and in transport terms;
4. Negotiation with those communities. Formation of village milk co-operative societies in each community and election of committees.
Contractual agreement reached under which the agency will lift milk twice a day, provide veterinary and input services, train village veterinary assistants chosen by the members, and train committee members in the management of collection and accounts.

5. Milk prices set initially at 20% below the weekly ruling rate, minus agreed deductions for transport, handling, processing, marketing, etc. This arrangement allows the payment to members for milk delivered to the village co-operative from funds advanced by the agency or union against sales at the following collection, i.e. twelve hours later. Every quarter the balance between the money paid out and actual earnings are settled. Settlement is invariably in the members' favour because of the large discount and the margins deducted to cover the cost of subsequent activities.

6. Over a period of years, members, through the village co-operatives, buy control in the plant from the agency, transforming it into a Union. In this way members, acting through village societies, control and share in profits made at the processing and marketing end of the venture. Discounts and deductions become convenient means to enable daily flows of milk, services and cash to take place between the central Union, the Co-operative Village Society and members. The discount figure can be reduced, particularly as reserves are built up to cushion market fluctuations. The discount and the margin are adjusted from period to period to reflect actual conditions as closely as possible with a margin left or adequate reserves established to cover errors.

A series of processes are set in motion which may be described as regional development engines (see Figure 1).

1. Twice a day trucks move out into the countryside from a centre or centres to collect the milk delivered by members to village societies. On the trucks ride veterinarians on regular visits to village societies, auditors of village society books, trainers and veterinary supplies, feedstuffs, concentrates etc. ordered by village societies.

2. Veterinarians are posted at the centre and at locations in the countryside. Each village society has trained veterinary assistants amongst its members who are able to handle routine chores and conduct A-I. They
Figure 1

Diagram Illustrating the Functions of and Relations Between The Central Union (or Agency) and Village Co-operatives
are backed up by regular visits once every two weeks when a veterinarian spends half or a full day in the village to inspect members' cows, train members and complete other tasks. Each village society has a telephone, even if the only one in the village, for use in emergencies, or a two-way radio system. Veterinarians will answer day and night, using small trucks for the purpose. Members pay veterinarian assistants a fixed fee every time a calf is born following A-I. In some communities members may be happier to pay a higher fee only on the birth of a heifer. The reason is that heifers may be regarded as bearing a greater promise of future cash income from milk than might young bulls from slaughter, sale or use as oxen. There should be fees for emergencies and for medicines set so as to prevent misuse rather than to cover costs. A general insurance premium is paid by a deduction from the milk price to cover the subsidies on medicines, staff costs, equipment and telephone.

3. There are set arrangements and procedures for milk collection at the village society to be followed morning and evening. The morning and evening collection at the Society's office becomes a focal point of village organisation and intercourse. A cycle of procedures is followed which is mirrored in the design of the building (Figure 2). The volume of milk delivered is measured and the volume entered in a book issued to each member. The quantity accepted from the individual member may be extremely small, even as little as ½ litre. A small sample of the milk delivered by each member is then tested for quality. This sample is numbered and then tested in a room screened from the reception area but where members may observe the test if they so desire. This avoids the possibility of corruption and gives the members confidence in the procedure used.

4. The best guide to milk quality (apart from the routine veterinary checks of the cattle themselves) is fat content. Members whose milk has an optimum fat content will receive a premium while poorer milk will be down-graded or rejected. Thus members are encouraged to improve quality as well as quantity by investing in concentrates, fodder, A-I, etc. Similarly, the union would test milk delivered in bulk from village societies and apply price premiums for good quality milk.
5. Although in a rural village farmers may have limited wants, the need for ready cash to meet these is of paramount importance. Payments should therefore be made every twelve hours. The milk delivered by a member in the mornings must be measured, tested and accordingly valued by the same evening when he is paid. The following morning he is paid for the prior evening's delivery. Members move from the collection office to the cashier next door in the society building.

6. Village societies, in collaboration with the union would also provide technical inputs and services to members. Cattle feed, concentrates, seeds, basic veterinary medication and necessities for milking (buckets, antiseptic soap) are stocked and retailed by the village society from a shop in the society building next to the cashier's window. The members are placed on a treadmill which provides them with the opportunity to make savings, investment and consumption decisions twice daily. They are able to use the cash received to invest in future milk production. This is a dynamic learning process. Knowledge is gained of how best to combine factor inputs to maximise output and quality and thus maximise return on investment.

The numerous, small, twice daily measurement, testing, calculation and payment procedures are important in themselves for they allow peasant members to feel confident in the ability to follow and control the system. It also provides immediate feedback to members on their and their cow's performance. Over time members may elect to reduce the number of procedures, for instance by reducing payment to once a week.

The Committee Room in the Milk Society building would be used for other purposes; for instance by the veterinary and health staff. Nonetheless, it is important that committee members have a room, with a door open onto the verandah where members pass-by, so that they can 'preside' over collection in some comfort and hence be in constant touch. Society members will notice which committee members are present most of the time and which are not, and how they busy themselves and weigh those factors at election times.

The close service and performance link between feed, genetic, veterinary and management inputs and milk production can be expected to have a broad
educational benefit. It should be possible to bring, through the spearhead teams of the Co-operative Union, members of village societies to the point at which they would accept a further deduction on the milk price to support a core medical service. In other words, investment in their own and their families' health. It is possible to piggy-back a medical scheme upon the infrastructure created. A medical scheme would replicate arrangements used by the veterinary service: regular village visits riding on the milk trucks, emergency calls, field stations in the countryside, village male and female health workers, nominal fees and higher fees for emergency calls. Existing government funding of health services should be turned over to such a scheme on a pro-rata basis per village as they choose to join. Non village dairy society members need not be denied access to the medical scheme. They could be asked to pay an annual membership fee in lieu of deductions from the milk price. At the same time, the society would stand ready to help them into the dairy business.

A similar development under co-operative aegis is the expansion of the milk transport business into a milk-cum-passenger service. In figure 2 there is a depiction of a flexible part conversion of a truck into a bus. The fact that the milk trucks travel twice a day at regular times into small villages means that they may be the only, if slow, possible passenger service in many areas. Provision for passengers would always be secondary to the transport of milk.

Small scale milk production fits well with the traditional concerns of African women. Women have had responsibility for gardens, always fenced, which are worked by hand hoe and fed by manure. Women, it is true, have not had much to do with the cattle. Men, boys and girls have played roles, but in decreasing order. However, the role of women has advanced considerably as migrant labour and schooling has removed men and boys, in particular, from the daily family labour supply. Some taboos no doubt remain strong, especially the entry of women into the kraal. The safeguard against the evil effects of menstruation appears to have been diluted by necessity in many areas so that unmarried daughters, though beyond puberty, and, successively, wives may enter. The taboo seems to be kept against daughters-in-law. A cow bower/garden complex in addition, if need be, to a cattle kraal and natural grazing would appear to be a not unusual development upon the start of commercial dairying.
The enhancement of the farm manager and local (cash) breadwinner roles of African women has begun to establish itself in the rise of women's organisations. The organisations, now quite common in much of southern Africa, are often the most effective organisations in the countryside. Many are, in turn, member organisations of national associations (the Women’s Institute, the National Council of Women, etc. - usually non-racial) and even of international organisations (International Country Women of the World, etc.). The growing organisational muscle of women and their increasing linkage to powerful national and international associations can be turned into material, human and political support for dairy co-operatives of the type outlined above but also for the prominence of women within them.

In any one region agricultural planners, hopefully community members and technical specialists working together within community organisations of the CLC/CSO type, would want to explore the possible ramifications of small scale dairying upon the small mixed farm sector. The calf, heifer, milk, manure, beef, leather and bonemeal outputs of the cow over her life are rich and varied. They are as good a starting point as any for intensive garden and staple cropping, for green fodder crops and for investment in irrigation.

The commercial importance of the cow and the involvement of large numbers of families in dairying helps to tackle other problems. The members of a CLC might decide to devote to cows in lactation paddocks of natural or planted pastures that are conveniently placed to avoid too much walking and which include water sources. Access could be on an equal share basis with the seasonal right being traded or, if most members of the CLC are also members of the dairy society, on a rental basis with the rent increasing steeply after two cows per member. That means provision for three cows per family, with one cow not in milk out on other paddocks, or, if in milk, fed at home. The progressive rent on good pasture above two lactating cows per member will help to encourage families to manage the A-I programme so as to distribute milk production more evenly over the year and to compensate, where weather and other factors make this difficult, by stall feeding. It also serves to ease the entry of small farmers to dairying, since it guarantees access to preferred pasture. Higher milk prices in the dry lean season and low prices in the wet flush season reinforce management moves towards more even production over the year.
Commercial dairying of the type proposed should ensure that a major share of value added in the production of milk goes to the small farmer. If that is the case, small farmers should find it profitable to grow fodder crops, including irrigated lucerne, or combination crops such as groundnuts. Development along these lines would do much to lessen seasonal variations in milk supply.

One of the most popular pieces of the renewed interest in appropriate technology is the methane digester, or bio-gas plant as it is often called. Its attractiveness is its separation of methane gas in the breakdown of waste material, principally cow-dung, vegetable waste and human excreta from what becomes a biologically pure slurry residue which is marvellous natural manure, particularly suited to vegetables. The gas can be used as a domestic fuel or to run engines. Many countries have pushed the adoption of family sized digestors but with mixed results. A few large scale digester schemes operate under educational institutions, though mostly with human excreta. The typical family digester requires a daily supply of material from at least three cattle. In the large areas of the world where cattle free range the cost of collecting sufficient cow-dung is prohibitive. In fact for all its attractiveness, the digester is often a more expensive and more troublesome way of procuring energy than is foraging for wood or the planting of trees (where that is possible) or the simple expedient of making and burning cow-dung cakes. One reason is that it is a capital item often without a direct cash return. It comes into its own, however, when cattle are mostly stall-fed, which makes manure collection easy, when there is a small local water supply and when a community can command or provide for itself maintenance services. The combination of co-operative dairying of the small scale mixed farm type proposed, the realisation of prices over grazing on common lands, stall-fed beef-rearing practices and the communal organisation inherent to co-operative dairying and the CLC create the type of institutional and physical setting conducive to success with methane digestors.

Theoretical work has shown large returns to scale, all the way up to a digester which serves a village of a hundred or more families. To my knowledge the organisational and pricing issues involved have prevented pilot plans being built and tried though they have been called for in the literature. Perhaps villagers need more experience of success with family size digestors.
first. Like the cross-bred cow, the digestor is a technical trick that may not by itself call forth the supporting attitudes, values and structures for success. But it can be added, though at an opportune moment, as a valuable reinforcement to advances already underway.

A regional small farmer dairy scheme of the type proposed can lend momentum to agricultural planning from the back door outwards. In other words, through, or largely through, the women. Backyard dairying will benefit from more locally available water. Village water supply schemes are expensive if not prohibitive when most families live in hamlets dotted over the countryside rather than in central villages. An interim step could be the inclusion of rain-water tanks financed against future milk sales. In many country areas, corrugated iron roofs are already common, though they are not essential. Women who have rain-water tanks claim that they transform their domestic lives. Water as an economic input to dairying should improve the financial feasibility of tanks considerably. One of the more successful official investments in the countryside has been small stock ponds. These, for example, are a feature of the Ciskei landscape. How such ponds, and more of them, plus ways to augment underground storage in conjunction with well development or stream fed dug tanks lined with plastic and sited so as to command settlements and gardens, fit into a cow-garden-fruit, bean, pod and leaf fodder and nut tree-manure-and hoe agriculture emanating from the back door is surely the proper approach to agriculture and family welfare in many areas of southern Africa.

The sequence of milk collection, co-operative dairy infrastructure and services leading into agricultural development emanating outwards from the backdoor is a powerful model, but one limited by local and urban milk markets. The alternative, in which the cow provides milk consumed by family, calf and pig, together with the garden is an equally interesting model of wider applicability. The cow-local water supply-methane digestor-garden model can be extended in other ways. Overflow from the digestor can be fed into a shallow pond as nutrient for water plants which in turn can be harvested daily to feed chickens or ducks. That pond, in turn, can overflow into a deeper pond in which fish, feeding in the enriched water, can be reared. If there is a sufficient flow of water, an overflow from the second pond can be led to the garden as a manure/irrigation application in one. Moreover, goats and sheep that free range on poor pastures but are kraaled at night add considerably to the supply of rich manure. Indeed, a milk goat, instead of a cow, can be the starting point for poor families.
142

FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER 10

1. In the Transkei the rinderpest epidemic decimated the herds. Some 80% to 90% of cattle perished leaving a prostrate peasantry unable to fulfil even the traction requirements of cultivation.

2. For instance, '84.7% of the Bantu areas of South Africa is natural veld, but only 30% is under a grazing control system'. Soil Conservation Board Annual Report for 1967-68, Pretoria.

3. To illustrate: in the Ciskei 65% of the land is suitable for pasturage. In 1952 in the Keiskammahoek 14% of families owned no livestock, 32% owned no cattle, 30% no sheep and 47% no goats (a), 30% of the families had no access to arable land. There has been no subsequent survey, but the position can only have worsened. Yet there is roughly nine hectares of pasturage per family in the Ciskei. While there is a relative paucity of land compared to white farming areas, of greater significance there is an absolute paucity in the institutional and programme sense. In Botswana, a more land abundant region and with more intact social and economic institutions, an official survey conducted in 1976 revealed that 45% of rural households live below the poverty line and that this figure is almost identical to the figure for those households who own no cattle. (b)


5. Ibid., p.39. The cost of development per hectare is roughly R3 500.

6. Of the approximately R1 million worth of milk sold by the scheme in 1980, only R72 000 went to the producers who number a mere 60 settler/tenants. Ibid., p.42.

7. Ibid., p.44.

8. Ibid., p.44.

9. Within sixty kilometres of the Keiskammahoek are several of South Africa's notorious resettlement camps, in which tens of thousands of people live without access to productive resources or local jobs.

10. 'The majority of the area is primarily pastoral country and represents some of the potentially most productive natural grazing in South Africa'. The Agricultural Potential of the Ciskei, University of Fort Hare, Faculty of Agriculture, 1979, p. x.

11. The model is based on the Amul Dairy at Kaira, Gujarat, India.
12. The following eight paragraphs are common to Schneier, op.cit., pp.60-64.


15. Personal communication, Professor Monica Wilson.

16. N.L. Alcock has proposed a similar scheme, without commercial dairying, for Zululand, 'Thoughts on KwaZulu's Agricultural Future' (unpublished).
CHAPTER 11.

AN APPROACH TO A COMMUNITY LED, STATE SUPPORTED SCHOOL SYSTEM

In earlier chapters we have argued that planning should be defined as the generation of novelties. Further, that participation, the gaining of experience and learning is to take place primarily at the periphery of society where failure can and should be expected to occur in small areas of society's functioning. Failure is to be seen as an opportunity to learn, to further knowledge, rather than as a threat to the central authority. The state's role becomes that essentially of underwriting change and creativity in dialogue with organised communities, interest groups and individual citizens. This scheme fits the radical requirements of the Basic Needs Approach: namely that all men have knowledge and experience; that human rights are inseparable from the realisation of material needs; that people must participate in all decisions which affect them; that there can be no monopoly on knowledge; and that debureaucratization is central to the building of human rights, mass participation and job creation.

In South Africa education has been bedevilled by a mean and prejudiced approach to the child and his rights. In economic terms it has been a perverse policy that ignores the central place and role of human capital development in the growth of a worthwhile society. In the last few years it appears that the state has been pressured into acknowledgement that it has a responsibility beyond that exhibited thus far. Recently the state has accepted a responsibility toward the pre-school child. While welcome, the latter, in particular, raises a concern that the state not exercise its new found sense of responsibility in ways which inhibit the continued discovery and exercise of community strength. That is so because the informal community movement's strength has arisen in some part around the desire, on social and economic grounds, for the provision of pre-schooling. Ideally, the state's involvement in this 'community-field' would serve to further community action.

The prerequisite to the emergence of a healthy education system appears to be a plan, finance and management model which defines acceptable state and community roles. The same model must provide the physical wherewithal with which to construct and operate a Charter for Childhood.
The key issues in the definition of state and community roles are:

Finance
Control
Choice and Parental Responsibility
Professional Standards
Information
Research and Evaluation

To these may be added the general goals of:

Equity
Efficiency
Response to local economic and social needs
Accountability to Parents, Community and State.

To achieve the balance sought between parent, community and state we need a device or mechanism that draws a line separating their respective responsibilities. That same mechanism must also allow the parties to the education system mutually to review the working of the whole. For that to be possible, each party must be endowed with a role and an agreed set of interests and responsibilities. In other words, the mechanism, by defining each party's respective responsibility, should allow a mutuality of overall interest to determine the ethos under which the whole is worked.

The state's prime responsibility, to ensure the provision of schooling to all children, does not require that it administer the schools. Indeed, it is the preponderance of state control that has been and will remain the source of suspicion and hostility in South Africa. State bureaucratic control, nonetheless, is problematic anywhere. A sense of partnership has to be engendered in which the essential power of choice vests with the parents.

The Voucher System:

A device, though imperfect on its own, which acts to delineate respective responsibilities is the so-called educational voucher. The voucher separates state financing of a modicum of education for each child from the administration of education. Each child receives a voucher with a face value set by
Parliament according to age or standard. Parents encash the voucher at a school of their choice. Parents become responsible for exercising choice of school and are expected to take a greater direct interest in child and school. Schools become private (i.e. non-government) and are managed by societies (e.g. Moravian or Catholic Church, Residents' Associations, Professional Associations, Employers, Trade Unions) or by individual Boards of Governors. Teachers may form associations or trade unions, but, not being state employees, are freer in their search for professional satisfaction. Government retains responsibility for inspection and for teacher training. The latter, inspection and training, is influenced by an increasingly organised private system which confers with government and which can assume greater responsibility for inspection and for training.

Objections to the Voucher System

Schools, being private, they, by definition, are free to charge over and above the voucher value. Any attempt to outlaw this on grounds of equity will fail because:

(i) parents have differing values and financial positions;
(ii) equality is not obtained solely by money spent;
(iii) home, community and peer group are significant factors in childrens' educational performance;
(iv) teachers are impossible to distribute equally in terms of ability and dedication;
(v) parents who care and can afford it, if blocked by law, will develop extra curricula activities for their children (e.g. extra lessons, membership of societies, etc.)

The result is that the voucher system can only be regarded as an equal financial input for children of a particular age or standard provided by the state. It fits the revised definition of planning: government underwrites schooling. Something else is needed to make the voucher system acceptable.

A Cross-Over Tax

It is proposed that a 40% tax be applied to fees charged by schools and paid by parents. Revenues from the tax, which is collected by the schools at the
beginning of each term when fees are paid, are placed in the National Education Fund. That fund is enlarged by the tax revenue, and redistributed the next term in the form of enhanced voucher values. In the next round fees may drop correspondingly and likewise the tax revenue. However, after a few terms it will stabilise so that voucher values can be predicted into the near future. The National Education Fund can be managed with a stabilisation fund so that there are no short term surprises.

The Financial Benefits of a Voucher Plus Tax System

The combined voucher and tax system leaves the advantages of the voucher untouched but adds several others. It allows the state, here in the form of a representative National Advisory Board, to underwrite society's concern for childhood and for investment in human capital. It does this whilst leaving it to every parent, community and association (church, trade unions, employers) to decide what is the optimum level of financial investment; that is, voucher+fees+scholarships. In other words, a more accurate total decision, made up from millions of decisions in society, as to what is nationally optimum. That figure is likely to be well above anything government might reach by itself. Private returns to education are invariably much higher than public returns. The system proposed brings public and private costs and benefits into greater alignment.

The tax introduces an element so far missing in South Africa, at least explicitly, namely that active measures have to be pursued to redress past and present inequities in the financial provision for services. It re-defines the simple goal of equity into a degree of equity synonymous with parent choice and with a nationally determined optimum level of investment in education.

Brief Notes on the System

Figure I attempts to capture the roles and the relationship envisaged between the State, Communities, Associations, parents, teachers, Educational Societies and School Boards.

Apart from the voucher, which represents a degree of redistribution arising from the tax system, and the cross-over tax which enhances both the
FIGURE I

Proposed Education System

- Ministry of Education
  - Inspectorate
  - Professional bodies
    - Training and research
      - Training
      - Research
        - Information public education
          - University, Colleges, Teachers Assoc.
            - Associations of School Boards/School Societies
              - School Boards
                - Teachers
                  - School
                  - 40% tax on fees

- National Advisory Board
  - Capital fund
    - Vouchers
      - Scholarships
  - National Education Fund
    - Parents
      - Vouchers
        - Choice responsibility
          - Community bodies
            - Churches, Trade Unions
              - Ministry of Education/Finance
                - National Education Fund
redistributive element but also communal effort, there would be a variety of scholarship programmes aimed at families who cannot afford fees or even the adequate provision of books, clothes, travel etc. The state, public bodies and the schools themselves would provide scholarships. A tax rebate on corporation and individual donations would be proper and useful. A vibrant equity, arising from state, parent and group decisions to invest in children, can replace a problematic quest for equity that equals sameness.

In the early years a capital fund will be needed to help schools achieve comparable levels of buildings, equipment, libraries, playing fields etc. A capital fund can be managed in a variety of ways. Suffice to say that it would be replenished every year from the National Education Fund. That would reduce the value of the vouchers (increasing fees and the size of the monies raised by the cross-over tax). It could be administered according to rough norms for each category with a maximum claim per pupil in a school in any two year period. The latter should be designed so as to force careful decisions over priority spending and to spread the period of claims over a manageable period in terms of supply of equipment and books, building construction industry capacity, trained personnel to man new facilities, etc.

A varied and useful information system should arise. Parents, the state, administrative bodies and teachers will want information of many kinds. Professional research papers and reports by state commissions, church commissions and teacher, community and parent associations should flow in abundance. Consumer magazines, like Which? in England, would be started if only to meet the demand for information of that kind.

Teacher training institutes will gain a more lively set of clients, face more field reportage and be asked to cater to a variety of particular school pedagogy or evaluation requests.

Teachers, removed from one monolithic employer, the state, become professionals rather than civil servants. They can seek professional satisfaction in a variety of schools and through careers that alternate between teaching, administration, research and teacher training. Advancement need not be constrained by adherence to seniority queues - a major reason for mediocre teachers favouring strong trade unions that can dictate hiring and promotional
policy - but by a greater variety of vertical and horizontal moves. Women, in particular, should find the field more open to them as professionals and as part-timers.

The mutuality of roles and responsibilities embodied in such an education system should be reflected in a National Advisory Board on which all the parties would be represented. The large number of government agencies which operate in the field of education, each under differing financial and administrative rules, would be collapsed into one Ministry with a limited yet vital support role to play.

Lastly, a large number of private schools, whether run by Boards of Governors or under Community, Church or Trade Associations, has two great advantages. It allows the whole school system to evolve rapidly by exploring at little cost a multitude of methods, procedures etc. This is in keeping with the state of cognitive science in which many old myths have been demolished but no one solid edifice erected in their place. Secondly, the invidious categorisation of children for life according to the 'type' of school they attended - white versus black, state versus private, or grammar versus technical - is more difficult to make stick when there are a large variety of schools following differing goals and methods.

An education system as proposed lends itself to all levels of schooling. Pre-schooling, however, is probably the least politically sensitive area of South Africa's common national life. Neighbourhoods, such as the Cape Peninsula, could adopt the system for pre-schooling as a national pilot and as a Peninsula-wide community programme. To begin with, it could be started in a few easily demarcated areas - Hout Bay, Fish Hoek, Ocean View, Crossroads, Atlantis - or in terms of schools that voted to join the programme. National Education and Capital Funds provided by the state and supplemented by civic and commercial bodies would be set up under a Mini-National Advisory Board for the Peninsula. The idea would be to provide a financial package that is attractive to participants while everyone comes to understand the system and the details are ironed out. Government could then announce that it would support the expansion of the programme according to a formula related to voucher values and capital fund provisions per child by age or
The dynamic for expansion would then rest with parents, schools, communities and other civic bodies. A politically quiet, but exciting and generative reform of the education system could be the result.

**Education and Rural Development**

The same revised voucher system, because it fits the aims of rural development and because it parallels many of the structures proposed, can be used as an additional engine of community development and of debureaucratization in the countryside. Further, it contains many of the mutual elements that go to elaborate the 'social contract' enunciated in earlier chapters.
CHAPTER 12

HEALTH: PREVENTION IS STILL REVOLUTIONARY

The advance of medical science and the provision of medical services has been one of man's most striking achievements this century. It is no wonder then that the further extension of those benefits holds a central place in the development programmes of both newly independent states and of countries which increasingly value the advantages of a healthy population.

I recall, as a young sympathetic UN employee, being summoned to a midnight meeting with Sheikh Mujibar Rahman days before his arrest by the Pakistan army, an event which led into the full fury of the Bangladesh war of liberation. He asked that I, on evacuation, tell the world of the horrors that were about to be unleashed. In reply to a question as to what homework the UN system might do towards the functioning of an independent government, his sole request was that it help draw up a programme to place a doctor in every village. This, he said, had been his foremost wish through many years of political activity and incarceration. Sheikh Mujibar's sense of the dramatic and of the popular acceptance of such a programme was not merely political; it was humanitarian.

Similar moves in the health field have followed independence in many countries. In South Africa some 'homeland' leaders have discovered that the replication of the by now conventional pyramid structure of health services, local clinics backed by hospitals, is one of the few areas in which they can make a mark. Variations of that model are being put into place in Cape Town and in Soweto. It is a generally accepted model and does produce results.

There are limits, however, that work to stop the model achieving the preventative and communal aspects sought in a good public health service. The medical profession shares many of the philosophical constructs that impede the utility of agricultural science. More than that, it is an elitist profession with strong layers of authoritarian and paternal behaviour.
The perfect patient is one who is cowed by medical authority. Consequently, even in neighbourhood clinics, it is exceptional to find doctors, nurses and patients enjoying rights inside a 'health community'.

The considerable literature on work place and communal medicine invariably regards the medical staff as being responsible for diagnosis and employers and bureaucrats for action. The objects of the programmes, workers, citizens and villagers, are left to play passive roles. Decentralization, in the form of local health committees, though proper, by itself may not alter the role of the 'member' and the fact that medical attention follows upon illness. One reason that is particularly pertinent in Southern Africa is that there exists a deep divide between intellectual pursuits and the life of the ordinary person. This divide is made more problematic by the isolation of most natural scientists from the culture of the streets.

Doctors, managers, bureaucrats and trade union leaders form an elite in the factory or neighbourhood clinic. Out of this elite flows a coalition of interests inimical to factory worker and citizen participation. The Workers Charter (Bologna, May 1970) asserts the right of workers to be responsible for ensuring that safety and health norms are applied and to pursue improvements in knowledge, rules and procedures. The aim includes worker exploration of the links between poor work conditions, oppressive management and regulatory structures and their physical and mental health. The approach is summed up in the maxim of Bologna's health policy, 'non-delega dello salute' (non-delegation of your own health).  

A review of health services in Latin America distinguished small under-funded non-government rural health projects as largely 'community supportive', whereas large regional or national programmes, for all their international funding and technical backing portray 'community oppressive' characteristics.
If health problems are not to remain hidden, then workers and community members must be brought to the point at which they will discuss their health and productivity in a situation which provides them with a chance to act, to assume responsibility. A further step to the implementation of the pyramid of health services appears to be necessary.

The proposal is a national health budget with a major component, community health, which is credited to every 'health society' on a pro-rata basis. The formula for the distribution of the budget would combine population with a 30% weightage for backwardness on the grounds of drinking water supply, sanitation, present health status of the population etc. Each 'health society' would be managed by a Community Health Committee.

Committees would be empowered to make proposals for the use of the health budget; proposals which are subject to approval by a specially constituted Sanction Office inside Government. The Committee can use up a stipulated percentage of the fund to employ technical advisers in the formulation of a community health plan. The advice can be provided by private practitioners or under a co-operative health service formed with other Community Health Committees.

The right of the Committee to formulate the local health plan is important for it provides an avenue for participation. Ultimately, health is education backed by a service system. Here an educational forum can be created. Members at an AGM would first set the broad goals to be followed by the Committee. Proposed plans would be presented to annual or special meetings for approval, before seeking official approval. The technical advisers chosen would no doubt attend and make a presentation, adding to the educational value.

A major set of decisions to be made would involve the use of funds at the Committee's disposal to support higher level medical services, such as hospitals, in conjunction with other Community Health Committees. This would be made on a rolling three-year contractual basis. This makes budget planning more certain and introduces elements of commitment, moderation and mutuality horizontally and vertically. Strong competitive
demands would exist, making decisions over type and manner of service keen. Requirements of the Department of Health for basic public health measures are likely to focus the attention of the community on cost effectiveness if funds for more individually satisfying services are to remain. The requirements themselves would come under more open challenge and professional discussion through the interplay of community, Committee, advisers, higher level services, other communities and Committees, Health Co-operatives and the working of the Sanction Office. It must be a requirement that objections to plan proposals by the Sanction Office be put in writing and be subject to arbitration if returned from a general or special meeting of the community. Arbitration to be conducted under once only rules by a small but broadly composed body of persons nominated by Government, Health Co-operatives, the medical profession and the medical officer of the area.

Once approved, the health plan would be administered on behalf of the Committee by professionals: either by the Department of Health, the City Health Office, staff of a Co-operative Health programme, or professionals hired by the Committee who hold approved qualifications.

The direct link of funds and problems is likely to generate innovative ideas and procedures that can carry the community forward. The professional links from the bottom to the top of the health service should ensure that any breakdown is reported. Further, the Department would retain powers of inspection and of intervention. These must be clearly spelt out and the procedures so designed to give the Committees and their communities and advisers time to respond to reports of breakdown except where action is necessary (immunization, etc.).

Medical service as an investment in health and wellbeing should lead to Committees proposing more comprehensive service with members paying more by way of fees and insurance premiums. Insurance, particularly the inexpensive major medical insurance, is one way of covering much of the support required for specialist services serving several Communities. Insurance can be officially encouraged by using a small part of the national funds available to subsidize premiums. It is the same principle that prefers subsidies on fertilizers (inputs) to subsidies on farmgate prices (outputs) as economically and administratively more efficient.
FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER 12


RURAL ELECTRIFICATION

A tax on the consumption of electricity is one of the most equitable - and essentially voluntary - taxes man can devise. If group action can serve to reduce the cost of electricity per unit, then a community may well agree to treat the consumption of electricity as a suitable base upon which to raise local revenues.

It is true that national electricity generating organisations, like South Africa's ESCOM, already sell electricity to Municipalities and other bodies. Indeed, there is a need to investigate the way in which municipalities in South Africa use revenues from electricity to subsidize rates; a move which primarily benefits the wealthier of white home owners. That, however, is not our present concern.

A small Moravian settlement, Genadendal in the Cape, has provided an instructive precedent. When the community decided to apply to join the national electricity grid they were provided with standard costs and charges per individual house by ESCOM. The community, with the assistance of a small fund raised through the Church, made a counter-proposal which was finally accepted by ESCOM; The principles used are of interest to us. The details are reported elsewhere.¹

The community, under the Church, formed an Electric Company. The company used the fund to finance members' connection, installation and electric appliance purchase costs. Prior street or zone agreements were reached to electrify houses so that economies on capital cost were realised. Repayments were built into the unit charges for electricity. The net effect was that higher consumption levels were achieved through group action than would have been the case had ESCOM dealt with individual families. The relatively high consumption levels allowed the Company to translate bulk ESCOM rates into unit consumption charges roughly 50% below those operating in the region. The Company has set charges to cover loan repayments and to realise a net profit, after providing for depreciation, which is the equivalent of revenue raised by a local tax.
The proposal that flows from the Genadendal precedent is twofold. That organised urban and rural communities adopt group action, drawing upon American and other community experience, and fund research and information gathering on a cooperative basis. Higher level service bodies like the CSOs have a role to play. The aim is to determine the optimum set of bulk charges applied by ESCOM or its equivalent in other countries that will provide opportunities for communities to use electricity consumption as a local tax.

The second part of the proposal is that banks see the financing of Community Electric Companies as a proper field for loan activity and equip themselves to play that role. Apart from communities contemplating electrification, there is a far larger potential clientele amongst communities already electrified but facing high charges per unit and, as a result, being poor customers of ESCOM or of some local Municipal or Provincial body.

FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER 13

CHAPTER 14

RIGHTS, PUBLIC INTEREST LAW AND THE FURTHERANCE OF DEMOCRATIC INSTITUTIONS

The more insidious effects of colonisation, and those which too often outlive independence, are false standards applied to economic activities. The reason is simple. A minority in power, especially when easily distinguished from other citizens, uses that power to set up discriminatory arrangements: regulations which act to prevent open entry to economic activities or which regulate sectors on behalf of the class with power.

The history of southern Africa is replete with direct legislative and budgetary acts that are discriminatory and with a host of government bodies which administer sectors with no accountability to society at large. State Boards to manage transport, irrigation and power systems, to regulate the marketing of crops and to set standards over the production of consumer items have tended to create monopoly systems or to act so as to prevent participation by small people. Many such state creatures of 'minority' legislatures are able to defy the legislature itself and to operate with little or no social control. The effects of this panoply of discrimination has been to impoverish once prosperous and independent pesantries.1

Post-independent society is invariably characterised by the emergence into political power of a small elite who control positions of strength in the bureaucracy, the police and armed forces, in agriculture and, though usually not so quickly, in business. The effect of a small and largely undifferentiated elite is to heighten tendencies towards centralisation of decision making. Existing colonial institutions are maintained for they fit the system of elite control. An influential party cadre, if not disciplined to respect government functioning and individual and community autonomy, is likely to further the hierarchical aspects of decision making, though in an extra-constitutional form.

The process of economic development has to be concerned with the realisation of human rights. That is, human rights have to be achieved in the development of society itself, not only by an initial formulation of human rights, though this will have a bearing on the approach. The realisation of human rights is a complex subject which requires understanding of the social and administrative processes in each society that nurture or suppress freedom, equality, security and unity.
Administrative, planning and political structures have to be forged that will allow a certain tension to exist between centre and periphery. That is between a concentration of power needed to make Government an effective instrument of development and the capacity of a people to realise its fundamental rights. The political, economic, social and legal means by which public and private institutions are held accountable for their performance and action in the realisation of human rights is the central issue. Local autonomy is a prerequisite, except that that must be restricted from infringement into areas of larger public interest.

Basic human needs are of three types:

(i) Needs of substance: that is the elements that form the quality of life; access to services, material security, opportunities to gain employment or for the use of land and other resources.

(ii) Needs of involvement in the process of society's working: individual and community participation in the planning and in the administration of development programmes.

(iii) Needs arising from the structures of society: primarily for the accountability for the performance of roles in the relations between people and government, between parts of government, between intermediate institutions and between parts of society to be held by the individual and by communities.

Citizens are not to be regarded as merely the objects of Government programmes. As citizens they enjoy rights and share responsibility for the realisation of these rights in the process of development. In other words, Government programmes are a matter of public responsibility and not a matter solely of public policy.

From the above, it follows that there are limits to what Government power alone can achieve. Government cannot sensibly accept the role of primary agent for the satisfaction of basic needs. Neither should Government adopt a policy which provides it with the power to plan and to execute development programmes. The reason is that Government, no matter how efficient, lacks the power of itself to design and control the relationships between people.
It can attain at best limited powers to constrain and to redress inequality, conflict and waste in society. Moreover, if human rights are to be realised in the full flowering of societal development, then Government has to be obliged to exercise controls over itself. The over-zealous pursuit of official goals, the abuse of power or measures taken simply to perpetuate power require that Government be subject to controls by intermediate institutions and by the community.

Unfortunately the legal systems and the practice of law in much of southern Africa have provided limited avenues through which to challenge through the courts economic discrimination and the abuse of power, even on the grounds of economic inefficiency. South Africa provides the example par excellence, but only in terms of degree, not kind of system that has existed. There Parliament can misrule.

The absence of a Bill of Rights, which requires that every law and official and private actions conform with natural justice, lies at the heart of the problem. The building blocks of society, at least in the legal and moral sense, are composed of those inalienable rights natural justice demands: to life, to freedom of speech, movement and association, and to the rule of law. An independent judicial system with a Supreme Court to review all law and policies brought by citizens and institutions is vital, for only then can it be presumed that Government action is acceptable.

In South Africa the process of discrimination has resulted in thousands of regulations and in the management of large parts of the economy by State agencies which are not properly accountable to the society they purport to serve. The minuitiae of discrimination have gone so far that it cannot be undone piecemeal. A reversal is required that would enable fundamental freedoms to be exercised and which would, in the process, make law more capable of development itself. Any so-called 'orderly' removal of legislation would be fraught with petty designs, would take forever and would cause confusion.

The intention of legislated economic freedoms and public interest constraints for the purposes of economic development would be to provide citizens with a well-defined pitch upon which to bat - to seek the most rewarding economic activity that did not transgress the public interest and to challenge obstacles and extravagances through the courts. The proposal is to instigate
what are here termed 'Economic Courts' to provide legal forums for the airing of individual and community challenges to official action. Action would include cases involving:

- individual infringement of individual rights
- community infringement of individual rights
- intermediate institution infringement of individual, community or other institution rights, and
- Government infringement of public rights.

Fig. I illustrates the relationship of the proposed Economic Courts to regular Courts of Law and to the system of Sanction Offices which are charged with the exercise of objective but solely negative powers over expenditure of public monies by communities organised for particular purposes; land asset management, health services, periodic markets, etc. The Economic Courts would accept cases brought mainly as a result of conflict arising between communities and official Sanction Offices or by members of organised communities concerned at the erosion of sanction use on objective grounds: i.e. equity, environmental soundness, financial viability, etc.

Parliament and party cannot devote the attention required to remove restrictions and to arrive at usable definitions of the public interest for a host of activities, but citizen action can. Citizens, acting legally upon the basis of fundamental freedoms, can help to rewrite not law necessarily but its administrative interpretation through cases brought before the courts. Where State Boards and Departments run large sectors of economic life unfettered by any effective accountability to society or by competition, law suits in the public interest can serve to define their proper spheres and the procedures, technology, cost structure and modes of operation and reportage they use.

A society which has strong community organisations, as communes or the variant proposed herein, the CIC, Credit Unions, Regulated Market Societies and the like, can treat these as closed systems in which members as a body set rules and regulate affairs in the general interest. Government's role is to provide a suitable framework of law, to indirectly oversee activities through open audits and the supervision of regular elections, to assist in the provision of an adequate service infrastructure, and to realise accountability functions by the use of retained objective sanction powers over expenditure proposals. In such a society the use of the courts would remain important. Cases brought to court would serve to maintain and further to define individual rights within community organisations, to define communal interests and to resolve conflicts between groups and communities at the periphery and government at the centre. Such a system should help to keep in check acts of collusion across the administrative boundaries of community and state by particular interest groups.
FIGURE I: The Administration of Rights and of the Public Interest

Parliament

Government

Bill of Rights

Supreme Court

Inferior Courts of Law

Official Sphere

Budgets Services Audits

Sanction Office

Economic Courts

Organised Communities

Proposals for Action

Individual citizen and member

Private Sphere
An ombudsman might help in certain respects but would not be placed in a position to regulate access to the courts. His office could help to frame cases, without however a monopoly over this procedure, and his or another office should provide public funds automatically to cover costs once courts accept cases.

At first reading, the above might suggest a recipe whereby large numbers of people would continuously seek redress in court rather than accept rules and regulatory actions laid down or implemented by properly constituted bodies. There might be an initial tendency towards a measure of anarchy of a self-seeking rather than a constructive nature for society cannot always contain its headstrong or deviant members. In the system proposed, such challenges would be open and channelled within formal avenues; avenues within which the seriousness and appropriateness of the challenge is considered by accepted authorities in due process of law. Frivolous, vexatious and argumentative actions would be rejected, with reasons given, from hearing in court. If conducted in an open, public forum manner the noisy and self-seeking elements can be revealed for what they are at little cost in financial or social terms. Serious cases will attract the public's attention and serve a vital educational role. They will cause to be brought into court, and therefore into the public eye, the full complexity of arguments pro and con on technical, ecological, financial, legal and social grounds. The real difficulties that exist in reaching clear-cut decisions, and the costs in society terms of refusing to hold anything but absolute positions will illustrate the need for mutual accommodation and for flexibility in the face of altered and of changing conditions.

It is in that lesson that public restraint in the use of the courts lies. Yet it is a lesson that upholds the use of legal action when other less costly, less dramatic and therefore probably less widely educational ways forward are blocked. Public interest law, whether brought by individuals or groups, acts as a governance on public affairs and thereby furthers individual confidence and interest in the working of democratic institutions. It helps to ensure that the development process leads towards citizen self-government, for self-government is a continuing right.

In Bologna, one of Europe's few model cities, the political and civic leaders do not worry when open conflicts develop between different levels within the city. For them it is not a danger to orderly government. As Mayor Zangheri states, 'We believe on the contrary that it is precisely such conflicts which serve in making clearer the will of the people, possibly even by means of
disagreements and controversies. We regard this as the correct way for the further development of democracy in Italy - the extension of the political dialectic'. He adds the point that, 'Everything which serves democracy is right, while everything that limits democracy just brings difficulties - for example, in the governing of a city. The crisis of some cities ... is precisely that, a lack of democratic oxygen'.

FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER 14


2. A South African euphemism for continued minority control.

CHAPTER 15

MANPOWER AND THE USE OF SOCIETY'S RESOURCES

Rural development is usually seen in mechanical terms: physical resources and capital. Even where these are relatively abundant, the way that capital is deployed to enlarge the productivity of natural resources is a question of human and institutional imagination and efficiency. When physical resources and capital are scarce, then the qualitative aspects of human and institutional functioning become even more crucial if a cumulative development process is to arise.

Southern Africa possesses a sophisticated core economy with managerial and technical capacities not matched in any but a few of the wealthier developing societies. This contrasts with the paucity of skills in the countryside. Government has not provided, nor will it in the medium term be able to provide, careers for the wide variety of technical, managerial and entrepreneurial types it takes to promote and sustain development. Rural society itself has as yet little to offer competent persons and consequently is a poor training ground.

Bridges acceptable to the skilled manpower of the economic core, yet governed by rural society, have to be constructed to allow a flow of skilled personnel between the core and the periphery. In the design of rural development proposed, community based and controlled institutions are the key to rural renewal. Yet the shortage of skills is most glaring at the grassroots. Able men and, increasingly, women turn to the towns to realise advancement or simply security. Formal education and training is scant and is neither particularly relevant to nor rewarded by rural opportunities. Well educated young people can seldom see a career in the countryside that furthers society except within a rigid government framework. They have either to opt for security and success in the private sector or to accept the established avenues of public service such as education.

Government itself cannot appropriately staff more than a handful of community organisations without a large recruitment. If it were to recruit it would breach two principles. Government cannot deploy staff to run community bodies without incurring too great an involvement in their success and thus
leading to transgressions of autonomy. And Government cannot provide in large numbers the right type of people in terms of vocation and skill. Neither would government be willing to take on its books an army of extra personnel which it cannot later drop. Government would prefer its commitment to success to be measured by its freedom to tackle policy issues rather than by the acquisition of manpower. Nor can governments easily find suitable candidates, even if a sea of unemployed exists. In fact, in many countries, overstaffing and ill-staffing in government are already serious and linked problems.

The nature and magnitude of the personnel issue once the EGS/CLC/CSO design is accepted requires special schemes, backed by government, to draw in the commercial and industrial sectors, whether private or public, because they constitute the present pools of skilled manpower.

1. **Staffing rural institutions**
   Companies hire, after normal selection procedures, extra personnel on the understanding that they will enter company service under an initial rural scheme. Successful candidates are required to seek a two-year contract with one of a number of rural institutions on the company list or to suggest their own preference. The company provides pension, health and other fringe benefits, but not salary. Salaries are set and paid by the host institution according to its own criteria and rules. The company may offer to reimburse the institution for all or part of the salary. The company, or more likely companies acting in concert, together with field agencies, would provide some suitable pre-field training.

After the two-year period, if successfully completed, the candidate is free to return to the parent company and is credited with two years' seniority. However, and this is the purpose of the scheme, if the young person so chooses, the company, or companies working together, will finance further training; for instance at the Masters or Ph.D. level. In southern Africa a provision for undergraduate and technical apprenticeships may be appropriate as well. The expectation is that, as the Peace Corps returnees amply demonstrated, after two years in the field the candidates will know more
or less what they wish to pursue in terms of training or research. At the end of the training, if successful, the door of the company remains open to the candidates. As before, the intention is that, although well equipped to climb the company ladder in pursuit of cohorts now four to six years in the company, the candidate will opt to sever the tie and to take his or her experience and qualification back into the field in support of rural development. The scheme has several advantages. It provides young people with a chance to explore (a vital consideration in poor or conservative societies), to grow, to gain particular skills (and the security they represent), and to realise careers that have either unfolded in the process or begin to seem possible and worthwhile. Sponsoring staff in this fashion provides companies with close insights into institutional and development issues and with a practical relationship upon which to build other forms of support. These may take the form of commercial and technical advice or of laboratory, design and fabrication assistance. Over time it will equip middle and senior managers with a background suited to fuller company involvement with rural institutions and agencies.

Returnees from a two-year stint in a field position, for instance with a CILC, a CSO, a Credit Union League, a co-operative in a particular crop, a rural health scheme, a district office, an audit firm working with the books of rural institutions, or in parts of training and research establishments, will make exciting but demanding postgraduate students. There is no university or technical college in southern Africa that today could take the challenge of such students in its stride. Hence companies should come together, perhaps under existing Chambers of Commerce, Industries and Mines, and, with national research bodies, to fund and to manage not only the scholarship programme but also a support programme to help universities and colleges to equip themselves. Extra staff, research monies, travel grants and funds in generous amounts are needed to enable faculty to work inside rural institutions every four years or so for a six to twelve month stint so as to keep abreast of problems and opportunities. The pay-off would be high. In South Africa and in Zimbabwe one could expect several hundred companies to each support two to four candidates per year, or a thousand plus entrants, with three to five
thousand young people of all backgrounds, several hundred faculty and umpteen company directors, technicians and managers at any one time legitimately grafted onto the endeavours of rural people. Once momentum has been built, the scheme could incorporate urban areas as well. Moreover, there is no inherent reason why the programme should not operate across state boundaries when it would serve to correct imbalances in the demand and supply of personnel on these terms.

Government should underwrite the whole to the extent of offering tax rebates on direct costs incurred and on grants to support the training programme. The rebates have to be set amidst local conditions, other provisions and with an initial intention to be attractive. Rebates of 60% on direct costs and 80% on grants - grants largely replacing Government liabilities - are suggested. A review procedure is outlined below.

ii. Short-term consultancy

Society should have fuller access to all the skills and knowledge now usually compartmentalised into company or bureaucratic straight-jackets. A society, registered under the Friendly Societies Act, which companies and government agencies join, should be formed to which persons in responsible positions in non-commercial organisations can apply for short-term assistance. For instance, a town clerk with a garbage collection problem, a municipal bus company unable to reach satisfactory utilization of capacity, a fledgeling co-operative with financial management or marketing difficulties, or an agriculture department with an engineering dilemma. The description of the problem, the nature of the applicant and an estimate of the skills required and of the work involved are sent by the Society's staff to the members. Simple issues might be circulated locally and complex problems nationally or even across country boundaries. Some requests might be fielded direct to particular members. Staff of the member organisations then respond, proposing to work on the problem. Their credentials are forwarded by the member organisation to the Society. Society staff vet the responses and appoint staff to work on the problem, often from a number of member organisations. Staff absence is treated as a mini-sabbatical within the member firm or agency.
Staff participation is likely to be seen as furthering the name and maybe the direct interests of the company or agency. Government should support the scheme by providing a tax rebate which, in this case, should not exceed 50% as real benefits to staff, to company morale and to company business can be expected. Companies and agencies should see it as a way of providing a public service at little cost within an efficient, open framework while enlivening staff careers and staff awareness of public issues. The scheme could accommodate spouses of employees who have suitable skills or experience. Most assignments would last less than one month, the majority being for a matter of days. A few might be for odd periods over a year or so.

iii. Opening the way to public and private sector financial, technical and managerial support for development programmes

The third scheme is, in a sense, a logical culmination of the first two schemes. In 1977, the Indian Parliament, itself traditionally suspicious of and often hostile towards capitalist organisations, approved a 100% tax rebate on monies spent on rural development by public and private sector companies. In essence the bill acknowledged that government itself could not handle the complexity and vastness of the subject and that it should be prepared to lose revenues, i.e. to reduce its own relative involvement at the rate at which companies became active. The rebate was seen as a simple, logical and radical step towards marshalling the resources of a large and poor but industrially powerful country in the battle against rural poverty.

To succeed, the rules of the scheme have to be of a negative character. Once approved, projects have to be managed without fears of tripping over bureaucratic fussiness. For instance, any person, department or body can propose a project. Companies, separately or jointly, can prepare, seek approval for and implement a project or appoint an agent to do the same. Once prepared, projects are submitted to a committee composed of a senior government officer as chairman, members from the technical ministries of government, a member from the banking sector, a representative of commerce and industry, and the taxman (Ministry of Finance). So long as the project is clearly formulated,
benefits and beneficiaries are identified, management and control are specified, and any contractual arrangements spelt out (fees etc.) and approved by all parties concerned, the project can only be turned down on conventional grounds such as equity, ecological, technical and economic. The main provision is that no capital asset shall accrue or service be provided to the sponsoring company (or companies) or its agents. With approval goes the taxman's stamp so that, as long as the company or its appointed agent keeps to the proposal, the 100% rebate is not at stake. Only direct costs are countable. This means that the company will carry the indirect costs of Board, management and personnel attention to the proposal. To ease administration, projects below a certain figure, perhaps R10 000, would not be eligible.

In fact, the scheme is a useful vehicle for banks seeking a project type framework within which to lend in the countryside. In India it was the nationalised banks which took the lead to involve commerce and industry as partners providing particularly management skills in rural development so that they, the banks, could be more active lenders in the countryside.

The scheme bolsters private and community efforts. It strengthens technical departments in government who can now join hands with industry outside the bounds of their budgets and rules. It opens up a wide variety of technical and human resources to communities and to co-operatives. It lends selective and 'business' oriented support to new ideas. It enriches the possibilities of experience for all. And it advances knowledge on a variety of fronts. Over time, companies are likely to float specialist agencies to identify and prepare projects, probably in partnership with the banking sector, and to develop a variety of modes of implementation. Staffing bottlenecks in the countryside will cause companies to depute middle and even senior staff, creating a desirable precedent for long term staff sabbaticals within publicly approved projects.

The 100% tax rebate applied in India is suited to the conditions there: existing high rates of company taxation, an economy with, at the time, sluggish growth and a general shortage of capital, and a mixture of a poor tax base in the countryside and poorly constituted local institutions.
Hierarchical social and administrative systems in India have fused with a strongly centrist economic model so that village government has become a client of the elite patronage-cum-political structure. The 100% rebate in India supports strong interventionist moves by commercial institutions in the countryside alongside or in partnership with government departments and innovative local leadership.

If strong community units are created, if equity considerations are furthered and if government limits its function to service rather than daily management, then the correct size of the tax rebate can be judged on the following basis: communities and other field units must be able to meet companies on a relatively equal footing if there is to be a mutually constructive exchange. Autonomous CICs and well staffed and backed CSOs, controlled in the main by member CICs, will go a long way to ensuring community strength. Community initiative and the ability to obtain the best from the commercial and industrial sectors will depend on the capacity of CICs and CSOs to provide a part of the finance for each project and a quota of intellectual and skilled staff input. Government's first task is to see that substantial funds are allocated to community budgets, with room for matching grants to locally raised monies. Rebates on company expenditure on rural development should not be so large as to withhold any significant funds from communities. The desired balance might be forced by a three-part rebate: high for personnel seconded to projects and to community or co-operative offices (80% say); fairly high for research, fabrication and other 'support' activities, using company infrastructure (60% say), and low (30% say) for other expenses which communities or institutional finance can or should cover (e.g. labour wages, local construction costs, basic materials such as cement, fuel, etc.).

For each country and for each period the balance between true private and public company concerns, a healthy industrial sector, and the public weal, rural and community development, must be struck. Nonetheless, too rapid alterations in company tax and rebate rates can only disrupt an intricate and potentially rewarding learning and service process. In the long run the aim is to help bring society to a fuller utilisation of all resources through a mix of commercial and public service relations; to a way of life, so to speak, in which rebates are fully accepted politically
but are understood to facilitate worthwhile goals, not to recompense effort or cost. To this end a national commission should be appointed every five years to review recent experiences under the programmes proposed. The commission would analyse the flow of expertise, assess the balance between institutional forces, trace the effects upon training and research and upon company operations, and make recommendations for improvements, including alterations in the rebate support of government. The membership of the commission should be selected one quarter by government, one quarter by community agencies, one quarter by commerce and industry, and one quarter by research and training institutions. Government should select the chairman from among the nominees. There should be a small permanent secretariat to maintain data, to undertake or supervise longer term studies and to serve each commission. The secretariat could be housed by an Association of Commerce and Industry or by a suitable federation of community or co-operative bodies. Commissioners should be appointed for the three years ahead of the five-yearly report so that studies can be commissioned in advance. In this manner a measure of continuity and of authority can be ensured.
IMPLEMENTATION: THE ART OF GOVERNMENT SURVIVAL

A Mixed Planning Model

The theory of planning is in its infancy in all countries. Indeed, much of recent literature has been introspective, questioning existing planning practice and even calling into question the very nature of planning. For all the questioning, '... little consensus has emerged on what to do about planning'.

Planning models are mixed models. They are mixtures of two extreme and artificial positions. The intellectual model is based on the notion that man has the ability to predetermine, to intellectually master the complexities of society; that an elite can define and set workable goals. The Marxian faith in reason, as exemplified in 'scientific socialism', sees development as the application of a priori knowledge. In its extreme form it can lead to a situation in which institutions and policies are deemed to be correct simply because they are. Ironically, the intellectual model contains within it the seed of an intolerance of intellectual quests because it cannot handle open analysis.

At the other extreme is the democratic model. It starts from the premise that man cannot hold all knowledge at any moment. Rather, it treats development as a creative process. The encouragement of variation, experimentation and the allowance of decline or even official abandonment of policies and institutions is part and parcel of the search for the preferred society at that moment. It recognises that the intellect is most useful in problem identification and in re-design. Consequently it sees the state as enabler, approximate designer, evaluator, disseminator; not as actively responsible for detailed working. It allows and recognises the role of politics, a politics that moves towards consensus on broad goals and of means. It is full of the noise of interest clashes and of social rather than intellectual (scientific) interaction at all levels of society. It suggests a certain withering away of the state.
Figure 1 depicts in simple form the usual concept of a continuum between the intellectual and democratic schools. Hence country A might be deemed to be to the left of country B (China vs. France).
The design of rural development outlined in this paper treats planning and implementation as a three part social system in which the parts have different roles and characteristics but interact to modulate each other (Figure 2). It recognizes an intellectual guiding quality at the centre, the elite held in check by elections to Parliament, by the duality of the administrative system and by the existence of a Bill of Rights.

A sovereign people, apart from 'giving' themselves a Bill of Rights, can entertain the abstract qualities that should inform society's functioning: that is to treat belief in reason as a guide to the design of systems. These goals are translated, in the mixed farming system, into institutional and programme designs subject to experimentation at the periphery to evaluation at the centre. The translation of goals cannot become an exercise in detailed central planning for that would contravene the rights of citizens.

It is a decentralised plan format that allows constituent units of the economy to make decisions on the basis of information (however partial) available to them. Planning's primary concern is with the development of capacities, at all levels of society, to invent solutions to problems that are expected to occur. Its subject matter is a set of interests centred upon market structures, rules of competition, income distribution and the fulfillment of institution and programme tasks. The allocation of resources is largely determined by groups and by institutions who can match decision making with the prime accountability for the use of public resources. The model fits Goran's thesis that in much of Africa there is a likelihood that not all sections of society (especially peasants held in a pre-capitalist mode of production) will accept and co-operate in the carrying out of a centrally determined plan concerned primarily with social goals and with the allocation of resources to achieve plan goals.

The periphery of society is formed by a series of what may be termed 'societies of actors'. For instance, a 'health community' which includes villagers and medical staff and by government's retained negative, objective sanction powers over the members' proposals for the expenditure of the village health budget. In the 'societies of actors' decisions are
reached by the interaction of members. Interaction is a procedure which can achieve the resolution of problems never formally entered onto an agenda; i.e. they are unrecognised. Problem solving of this type is an outcome, not a specific decision. It is part of the rejection of a search for the perfect in favour of the discernment of what is optimal at any one moment. It supports the autonomy and rights of individuals and groups within the overall interest of society. Its effective functioning requires the elaboration of the social contract, a continually better defined charter for the land through member, group and public interest law decisions within and between territorially organised communities, the proposed CLCs, and strong economic rights and constitutional freedoms.

Put briefly, it is a question of process; of means rather than ends. It accepts that ends vary and, in any case, are not always clearly perceived. As Zangheri has stated; the revolution never comes, the new man never appears. Our privilege, it appears, is only to work towards the conditions for revolution.

Administration

Central planning, espoused as in the public good, can easily descend into a technique of control. It is often welcomed by opportunistic elements in political parties, in the bureaucracy, by trade union leaders and even by some managers as it does promise elite status, easy schedules, security and relatively good incomes. Central planning has led to the mass demoralisation of citizens in many East European societies, including the USSR. A lack of participation, a denial of autonomy and of rights of membership in active self-regulated institutions has quashed creativity. Unholy alliances between bureaucrats and managers, managers and workers are common in the literature. Alcoholism, rising death rates and worsening social indicators of all kinds reflect the malaise. Planning has become increasingly fictional: an exercise in oiling the state machinery. In the West the same type of sickness exists when companies are reliant on defence and other government contracts.

A more general and subtle problem exists which is anathema to rural development. There is a tendency in all societies for organisations to seek to
maximise the number of preferred positions for their members. In a bureaucracy this tendency leads to: an enlargement of senior and middle order positions located in the capital or provincial cities; it denies the smaller towns and the countryside local centres of administrative decision making; the bureaucracy backs moves to expand the sphere of official control as in the creation of parastatals and nationalisation for these moves open up additional highly paid positions enjoying perks and privileges usually denied to civil servants. The process parallels that in the private sector in which acquisitions and take overs secure career opportunities.

A hierarchical administration system can quickly upset an intention to respect decentralisation and local autonomy by demanding that government field officers spend a considerable amount of their time reporting upwards and attending to promotional chances off the field. Local level initiative and innovation are quickly swamped by the demands of an office preoccupied with the legitimisation of higher functions. Reportage from the field, in that situation, can become as much a fiction as has planning in Russia. Concentration on the elements of tension, balance and modulation between centre and periphery is the major issue in the achievement of an acceptable legal and administrative framework for the expression of planned social and economic development. It is, moreover, a paradigm that relieves government of direct responsibility for society's functioning. Citizens are enabled and invited to assume responsibility. In that manner economic analysis and interests come to the fore, mostly in forums at the periphery, so that political education and action is promoted without great threat to the centre. Government, in this model, occupying a detached off the field position can live to fight another day. Continuity and the steady if varied accretion of physical and social gains is the proper path.

Implementation

Implementation is the most locally determined of the rural development arts. A number of the proposals made can be introduced one by one or in limited areas to begin with. The aim should be to develop local capacities and confidence and to use the programmes to re-draw administrative boundaries and to educate citizen and bureaucrat alike in the working of the social contract.
Table 1 depicts a likely set of sequences in the implementation of the proposals. The key to the timetable is the responsibility of government to provide the enabling framework, to oversee the creation of adequate service capacities and to formulate suitable policies. Pilot projects and regional exercises would be needed to establish procedures and clarify rules. Major transformations, as the upgrading of the traditional right of access in African society to a share in the commonly held assets, the CLC would follow as outcomes of other programme benefits:

Table 1: Implementation: likely sequence

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pilot Programmes</th>
<th>Year 1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EGS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credit Union</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extension</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regional</th>
<th>Year 1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Periodic</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Market/Service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delivery Strategy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agric. Ext</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EGS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credit Union</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>National</th>
<th>Year 1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Credit Union</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>League</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agric. Ext</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EGS</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resettlement</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credit Union</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
economic security, participation, control over services, the exercise of responsibility and group action. The construction of novelties and an expectation of progression is underwritten by the security and participation elements of the social contract. Women are provided with meaningful equality, choice and controls over land, services, markets and institutions.

Conclusion

The design of rural development proposed allows an economic development strategy to unfold composed of the following:

i Rural households retain a link with the land.
ii Elements of co-operation in African society are furthered.
iii Local market development and regional specialisation provide the basis for correcting rural-urban dependencies.
iv A small scale mixed farm sector is promoted within institutional arrangements that allow and even encourage co-operative effort; probably of the service and input rather than productive type. Such a sector promises to optimise land and labour use.
v The explosion of towns, principally the metropolitan areas, is dampened by the growth of local strengths.
vi Rural industry has a more stable rural income/market upon which to grow (the EGS plus the CLC and periodic markets).
vii Consumer demand can be expected to grow rapidly in the countryside. The demand will be largely for basic necessities of food and clothing, for particular items such as bicycles, radios and simple farm and household equipment, and for services, especially health and education. Existing industrial capacity can handle a demand for commodities of that nature without serious foreign exchange requirements or inflationary effects. Government will have to develop the training facilities to match the demand for services, including financial systems that ensure that the rural population become increasingly important financiers of health and education themselves.
viii Population policy and measures become more viable when communities take prime responsibility for their health, when land is expressed as an asset in which individuals enjoy but a share, when some part of the direct costs of services are borne by users, when specialist roles are provided in greater number and when economic security is underwritten by the state and enhanced by membership of community organisations (the EGOS and CLC in particular).

ix Each 'society of actors' provides a valuable laboratory for research and for evaluation as it represents a managed body with specified goals and known means.

x Problems of maintenance, a dichotomy with centralised capital and current budgeting, are resolved in the household nature of community management.

Some of the above are depicted in Figure 11. It illustrates a valley, the families of which have formed a CLC and made progress on the demarcation and arrangements of land use. Individual residential plots; an allotment garden scheme; arable, intensive (dairy) pasturing and extensive grazing; woodlots and a communal forest; conjunctive canal, well and lift irrigation; rural electrification; and the beginnings of villagisation are shown.

FOOTNOTES TO CHAPTER 16


5. This accords with the call for greater local participation and decentralisation, particularly in the third world. See, for instance, Ann Seidman, Planning for Development in Sub-Saharan Africa, New York, Praeger, 1974.

6. In some countries strong groups opposed to any reform of the planning system have arisen simply to defend interests that have arisen, see Andrzej Korbonski, 'Bureaucracy and Interest Groups in Communist Societies: The Case of Czechoslovakia', in Studies of Comparative Communism, 4,1, January 1971, pp.57-79.
Figure 11

1. Preserved uplands
2. Community forest
3. Extensive community grazing, seasonal irrigation, gully, floods
4. Intensive dairy pasture, individual control, water
5. Woodlot & fruit
6. Homesteads
7. Cropland: individual or group management, lift pumps
8. Garden land - within canal & well irrigation system
9. Nascent village
10. Rural electrification - for water pumps, grinding mill, village lighting
11. Cooperative dairy with telephone

Community Land Company
To anybody interested in what is happening in Southern Africa at the present time, it is clear that an understanding of changes taking place in the field of labour is crucial. The whole debate about the political implications of economic growth, for example, revolves very largely around different assessments of the role of black workers in the mines and factories of the Republic. Many of the questions with which people involved in Southern Africa are now concerned relate, in one way or another, to the field generally set aside for labour economists to cultivate. The impact of trade unions; the causes of unemployment; the economic consequences of different educational policies; the determination of wage structures; the economics of discrimination; all these and more are matters with which labour economists have been wrestling over the years in various parts of the world.

At the same time there are many who would argue that these issues are far wider than can be contained within the narrow context of ‘labour economics’. These issues, it is pointed out, go to the heart of the whole nature of development. In recent studies, commissioned by the International Labour Office, of development problems in Columbia, Sri Lanka, and Kenya, for example, leading scholars have identified the three crucial issues facing these countries as being poverty, unemployment, and the distribution of income. Thus the distinction between labour and development studies is becoming more blurred as economists come face to face with problems of real life in the Third World.

It is here too that an increasing number of people are coming to see that study of the political economy of South Africa must not be done on the assumption that the problems there are absolutely different from those facing other parts of the world. Indeed it can be argued that far from being an isolated, special case, South Africa is a model of the whole world containing within it all the divisions and tensions (black/white; rich/poor; migrant/nonmigrant; capitalist west/third-world; etc.) that may be seen in global perspective. Be that as it may, the fact remains that the economy of Southern Africa (for the political and economic boundaries are singularly out of line with each other) is one of the most fascinating in the world. It is one on which far more research work needs to be done, and about which further understanding of the forces at work is urgently required. It is in order to attempt to contribute to such an understanding that Saldu is issuing these working papers.

SALDRU
Division of Research
School of Economics
University of Cape Town
7700 Rondebosch